

VIDEOCONFERENCE MEETING

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

LANDS COMMISSION

ZOOM PLATFORM

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 17, 2020

10:02 A.M.

JAMES F. PETERS, CSR
CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER
LICENSE NUMBER 10063

APPEARANCES

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Ms. Betty T. Yee, State Controller, Chairperson

Ms. Eleni Kounalakis, Lieutenant Governor

Ms. Keely Bosler, Director of Department of Finance,
represented by Ms. Gayle Miller

STAFF:

Ms. Jennifer Lucchesi, Executive Officer

Mr. Colin Connor, Assistant Executive Officer

Mr. Seth Blackmon, Chief Counsel

Mr. Mark Danielson, Sea Grant Fellow

Ms. Lina Ceballos Osuna, Senior Environmental Scientist,
Marine Environmental Protection Division

Ms. Kristina Kunkel, Sea Grant Fellow

Ms. Yessica Ramirez, Staff Services Manager, Environmental
Justice Liaison, Executive Office

Ms. Katie Robinson-Filipp, Environmental Scientist

ATTORNEY GENERAL:

Mr. Andrew Vogel, Deputy Attorney General

ALSO PRESENT:

Ms. Lisa Beutler, Stantec

Dr. Jeff Boehm, The Marine Mammal Center

Ms. Casey Cruikshank, Northcoast Environmental Center

Ms. Susanne Cumming, Sierra Club

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

ALSO PRESENT:

Mr. Ryan Davis

Mr. Jason Giffen, Port of San Diego

Ms. Marcia Hanscom, Ballona Wetlands Institute

Ms. Lisa Karlan

Ms. Christina Ku

Ms. Lisa Levinson, In Defense of Animals

Ms. Patricia McPherson, Grassroots Coalition

Ms. Patricia Miller

Mr. Ken Owen, Channel Islands Restoration

Ms. Heidi Petty, Contra Costa Resource Conservation
District

Ms. Leslie Purcell

Mr. Tom Rudolph, The Pew Charitable Trusts

Ms. Jennifer Savage, Surfrider Foundation

Ms. Laurie Smith, Los Cerritos Wetlands Land Trust

Dr. Andrew Thurber

Ms. Mary Beth Trautwein

Ms. Andrea Treece, Earthjustice

Ms. Lily Tsukayama, Port of San Diego

Ms. Mona Olivas Tucker, Tribal Chair, yak tityu tityu yak
tilhini, Northern Chumash Tribe

Ms. Courtney Vail, Oceanic Preservation Society

Mr. Robert van de Hoek

Ms. Jane Velez-Mitchell, JaneUnChained

	<u>INDEX</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
I	10:00 AM - Open Session	1
II	Public Comment	6
	Public comments will be heard at 10:00 am for items not on the agenda, for no more than 30 minutes. At the discretion of the Chair, speakers will be given up to 3 minutes. For those unable to attend the early public comment period, there may be additional comment time available later in the day. Note: Comments made during the general public comment period regarding matters pending before the Commission do not become part of the official record for those matters.	
III	Confirmation of Minutes for the October 22, 2020 meeting	31
IV	Executive Officer's Report	32
	Continuation of Rent Actions to be taken by the Executive Officer pursuant to the Commission's Delegation of Authority:	
	- No items	
	Tomales Bay Assignment Actions to be taken by the Executive Officer pursuant to the Commission's Delegation of Authority:	
	- Michael Reppy (ASSIGNOR); John Henry (ASSIGNEE): Assignment of General Lease - Recreational Use located on sovereign land in Tomales Bay, adjacent to 19225 Highway 1, near Marshall, Marin County (PRC 9410.1)	
	- Mark Carlson (ASSIGNOR); Clumber Spaniel 1031, LLC (ASSIGNEE): Assignment of General Lease - Recreational Use located on sovereign land in Tomales Bay, adjacent to 18565 State Highway 1, near Marshall, Marin County (PRC 9374.1)	

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- V Consent Calendar 01-59 49
The following items are considered to be
oncontroversial and are subject to change at any
time up to the date of the meeting.

Land Management

Northern Region

- 01 BROCKWAY PROPERTY LLC (APPLICANT): Consider
application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of
sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 9820
Lake Street, near Brockway, Placer County; for an
existing pier, boat hoist, and two mooring buoys. CEQA
Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 5648;
A2153; RA# 2019019) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: J. Toy)
- 02 CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION (APPLICANT):
Consider termination of a Public Agency Permit and
Right-of-Way Map and issuance of a Public Agency
Permit and Right-of-Way Map pursuant to Section 101.5
of the Streets and Highway Code and Section 6210.3 of
the Public Resources Code, for sovereign land in the
Sacramento River, adjacent to State Highway 162, near
Butte City, Glenn County; for the Butte City Bridge
Replacement Project. CEQA Consideration: Mitigated
Negative Declaration, adopted by the applicant, State
Clearinghouse No. 2019039046, and adoption of a
Mitigation Monitoring Program. (Permit 2470; A2464;
RA# 2019183) (A 3; S 4) (Staff: A. Franzoia)
- 03 CHERRYVALE HOLDINGS, LLC, A LOUISIANA LIMITED
LIABILITY COMPANY (LESSEE); GDP GROUP LLC, A DELAWARE
LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANY; REYNOLD J. DILENA
(APPLICANT): Consider waiver of rent, penalty, and
interest; acceptance of a lease quitclaim deed for
Lease No. PRC 9154, a General Lease - Recreational Use
for two existing mooring buoys; and application for a
General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land
located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 6229 and 6259 North
Lake Boulevard, Carnelian Bay, Placer County; for two
existing mooring buoys; construction of a joint-use
pier; and removal of an existing deck and bulkhead not
previously authorized by the Commission. CEQA
Consideration: categorical exemptions. (Lease 9154;
A2858; RA# 2020100) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: S. Avila)

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- 04 FANCY PINE, LLC, A CALIFORNIA LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANY (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 5560 West Lake Boulevard, near Homewood, Placer County; for two existing mooring buoys. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 8252; A2565; RA# 2019320) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: S. Avila)
- 05 FINANCIAL PORTFOLIOS LIMITED, AN IRISH CORPORATION (APPLICANT): Consider waiver of penalty and interest and application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in the Petaluma River, adjacent to 5636 Lakeville Highway, near Petaluma, Sonoma County; for an existing boat dock, pier, and appurtenant facilities. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 3696; A2276; RA# 2019081) (A 10; S 3) (Staff: J. Toy)
- 06 OLIVER BARNHARD FRIEDRICHS (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 1270 West Lake Boulevard, near Tahoe City, Placer County; for two existing mooring buoys. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 8883; A2520; RA# 2019232) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: S. Avila)
- 07 HOLLY HEATH FULLER, TRUSTEE OF THE HEATH FAMILY 2011 IRREVOCABLE TRUST FBO HOLLY HEATH FULLER UTA DATED AUGUST 17, 2011; MICHAEL R. PIRO AND SHANNON T. PIRO, TRUSTEES OF THE PIRO FAMILY TRUST, DATED SEPTEMBER 21, 2016 (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 4812 and 4826 North Lake Boulevard, near Carnelian Bay, Placer County; for an existing joint-use pier with a boat lift, boathouse with two boat lifts, and four mooring buoys. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 8842; A2624; RA# 2019301) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: L. Anderson)
- 08 HERATAGE COVE HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION, INC. (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 7580 North Lake Boulevard, near Tahoe Vista, Placer County; for an existing pier, 28

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- mooring buoys, and two marker buoys. CEQA
Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 4322;
A2652; RA# 2019326) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: L. Anderson)
- 09 HUMBOLDT BAY HARBOR RECREATION AND CONSERVATION
DISTRICT (LESSEE/SUBLESSOR); PENINSULA COMMUNITY
SERVICES DISTRICT (SUBLESSEE): Consider endorsement of
a sublease under Lease No. PRC 3186, a General Lease -
Right-of-Way Use, of sovereign land located in the
Pacific Ocean, adjacent to Assessor's Parcel Number
401-111-006, near Samoa, Humboldt County; for an
existing outfall pipeline. CEQA Consideration:
categorical exemption. (PRC 3186; A2633; RA# 2019309
(A 2; S 2) (Staff: A. Franzoia)
- 10 DAVID B. KENT AND DARCIE T. KENT, AS TRUSTEES OF THE
KENT REVOCABLE TRUST DATED JUNE 8, 2005 (APPLICANT):
Consider acceptance of a lease quitclaim deed for
Lease No. PRC 3682, a General Lease - Recreational
use; and application for a General Lease -
Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake
Tahoe, adjacent to 803 Stateline Avenue, South Lake
Tahoe, El Dorado County; for an existing pier;
construction of a catwalk, ramp, and boat lift; and
removal of an existing mooring buoy. CEQA
Consideration: categorical exemptions. (Lease 3682;
A2625; RA# 2019346) (A 5; S 1) (Staff: S. Avila)
- 11 JEFFREY M. LONG, TRUSTEE OF THE J AND S LONG LIVING
TRUST DATED AUGUST 3, 2004 (APPLICANT): Consider
application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of
sovereign land in Donner Lake, adjacent to 15799
Donner Pass Road and 10087 Lake Edge Court, near
Truckee, Nevada County; for an existing pier
previously authorized by the Commission and an
existing floating dock not previously authorized by
the Commission. CEQA Consideration: categorical
exemption. (Lease 7861; A2648; RA# 02506) (A 1; S 1)
(Staff: A. Franzoia)
- 12 PETER MICELLI AND JENNIFER LANG (APPLICANT): Consider
application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of
sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 8769
Rubicon Drive, near Rubicon Bay, El Dorado County; for
two existing mooring buoys. CEQA Consideration:

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- categorical exemption. (Lease 8159; A2619; RA# 2019299) (A 5; S 1) (Staff: J. Toy)
- 13 JADE MILLER AND TENLEY MILLER, TRUSTEES OF THE JADE A. MILLER FAMILY TRUST AGREEMENT DATED MARCH 15, 1991, RESTATEMENT DATED AUGUST 29, 2016 AND ANY AMENDMENTS THERETO (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 8829 Winston Way, near Rubicon Bay, El Dorado County; for three existing mooring buoys not previously authorized by the Commission. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (A2563; RA#2019270) (A 5; S 1) (Staff: L. Anderson)
- 14 NASUS PARTNERSHIP, A CALIFORNIA LIMITED PARTNERSHIP (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 3650 North Lake Boulevard, near Kings Beach, Placer County; for an existing open pile pier, a rock crib pier with breakwater, two seasonal boat docks, and one mooring buoy. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 2289; A2233; RA# 2019057) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: J. Toy)
- 15 PACIFIC GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY (LESSEE): Consider amendment to Lease No. PRC 6205, a General Lease - Right-of-Way Use, of sovereign land in the Russian River, adjacent to the Wohler Road Bridge, near Santa Rosa, Sonoma County; for the relocation of overhead electric transmission lines. CEQA Consideration: Mitigated Negative Declaration, adopted by Sonoma County, State Clearinghouse No. 2014082054, and adoption of a Mitigation Monitoring Program. (Lease 6205; RA# 2020077) (A 2; S 2) (Staff: A. Franzoia)
- 16 PASHA FAMILY LEGACY REAL ESTATE LLC, A CALIFORNIA LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANY (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 5398 North Lake Boulevard, Carnelian Bay, Placer County; for an existing pier with open-sided boathouse, sundeck with stairs, two boat lifts, and two mooring buoys not previously authorized by the Commission. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (W27233; RA# 18418) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: S. Avila)

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- 17 PREMIER TRUST, INC., TRUSTEE OF THE AMV 2012 SIGNATURE TRUST DATED DECEMBER 28, 2012; AND PREMIER TRUST, INC., TRUSTEE OF THE JAV, II 2012 SIGNATURE TRUST DATED DECEMBER 28, 2012 (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 8527 Meeks Bay Avenue, near Meeks Bay, El Dorado County; for an existing pier, boat lift, and two mooring buoys. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 7613; A2554; RA# 2019267) (A 5; S 1) (Staff: J. Toy)
- 18 JOHN H. SCULLY, TRUSTEE OF THE JOHN H. SCULLY LIVING TRUST, DATED OCTOBER 1, 2003 (ASSIGNOR); 1360 WEST LAKE LLC, A CALIFORNIA LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANY (ASSIGNEE): Consider assignment of a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent 1360 West Lake Boulevard, Tahoe City, Placer County; for an existing pier, boat lift, and two mooring buoys. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (PRC 7380; A2711; RA# 2020017) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: L. Anderson)
- 19 SERENE PROPERTIES, LLC, A CALIFORNIA LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANY (LESSEE); LIP-BU TAN AND YSA LOO, TRUSTEES, FBO LIP-BU TAN AND YSA LOO TRUST DATED FEBRUARY 3, 1992 (APPLICANT): Consider acceptance of a lease quitclaim deed for Lease PRC 8510, a General Lease - Recreational Use, and application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 2200 North Lake Boulevard, near Tahoe City, Placer County; for two existing mooring buoys. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 8510; A2541; RA# 2019265) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: S. Avila)
- 20 TIMOTHY SMITH, TRUSTEE OF THE TAHOE TRUST CREATED UNDER THE S-D LIVING TRUST DATED JANUARY 30, 1987 (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 2200 Sunnyside Lane, near Tahoe City, Placer County; for an existing pier with boat slip and one mooring buoy. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 3704; A2298; RA# 2019100) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: J. Toy)

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- 21 TAHOE LLC, A SOUTH DAKOTA LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANY (LESSEE): Consider correction to prior authorization of Lease 3548, a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 6820 West Lake Boulevard, near Tahoma, Placer County; for an existing pier and two mooring buoys. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (Lease 3548; A2362; RA# 2019135) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: J. Toy)
- 22 THARSING FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, A CALIFORNIA LIMITED PARTNERSHIP (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 8341 Meeks Bay Avenue, near Meeks Bay, El Dorado County; for an existing pier and one mooring buoy. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 2366; A2760; RA# 2020057) (A 5; S 1) (Staff: S. Avila)
- 23 THE ESTATE OF BRIAN J. METTLER, BY DEBRA SUZANNE METTLER, HIS ATTORNEY-IN-FACT (ASSIGNOR); WILLIS K. POLITE JR., TRUSTEE OF THE WILLIS K. POLITE JR. TRUST DATED APRIL 18, 2014 (ASSIGNEE): Consider assignment of a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 1600 and 1620 North Lake Boulevard, Tahoe City, Placer County; for an existing joint-use pier, two boat lifts, and three mooring buoys. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (PRC 5561; A2786; RA# 2020058) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: M.J. Columbus)
- 24 KENNETH A. TUCKER AND BRUCE NICHOLSON TUCKER, TRUSTEES OF THE TUCKER 1984 FAMILY TRUST AGREEMENT (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Lake Tahoe, adjacent to 2885 West Lake Boulevard, near Homewood, Placer County; for two existing mooring buoys not previously authorized by the Commission. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (A2564; RA#2019271) (A 1; S 1) (Staff: L. Anderson)

Bay / Delta Region

- 25 ASSOCIATION OF SURFING PROFESSIONALS, LLC (DBA WORLD SURF LEAGUE) (LESSEE); MAVERICKS VENTURES, LLC (APPLICANT): Consider acceptance of a lease quitclaim deed for Lease 9509, a General Lease - Other, and

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- application for a General Lease - Other, of sovereign land located in the Pacific Ocean, near Pillar Point, San Mateo County; to conduct professional surfing contests. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 9509; A2329; RA# 2019112) (A 22, 24; S 13) (Staff: M. Schroeder)
- 26 RUTH SARAHI AWAN AND HATIF KAIYOOM AWAN (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use of sovereign land located in the Calaveras River, adjacent to 2955 Calariva Drive, Stockton, San Joaquin County; for an existing boat dock, ramp, and landing. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 5562; A2608; RA# 2019292) (A 13; S 5) (Staff: J. Holt)
- 27 GARY BELL AND JANE BELL, TRUSTEES OF THE GARY AND JANE BELL REVOCABLE TRUST DATED OCTOBER 12, 1998 (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Tomales Bay, adjacent to 174 Camino Del Mar, near Inverness, Marin County; for an existing pier, two walkways, a boathouse, stairs, and four pilings. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 3240; A2726; RA#2020075) (A 10; S 2) (Staff: G. Asimakopoulos)
- 28 CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION (PARTY): Consider approval of the 2020 Category 1 benchmark rental rates for Tomales Bay Berths and Buoys for sovereign land in Tomales Bay, Marin County. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (W27247) (A 10; S 2) (Staff: D. Tutov, K. Foster)
- 29 CITY OF OAKDALE (LESSEE): Consider amendment of Lease 5221, a General Lease - Public Agency Use, of sovereign land located in the Stanislaus River, near Oakdale, Stanislaus County; for installation of three sewage pipelines. CEQA Consideration: Mitigated Negative Declaration, adopted by the City of Oakdale, State Clearinghouse No. 2019089122, and adoption of a Mitigation Monitoring Program. (Lease 5221; A2586; RA# 2019316) (A 12; S 8) (Staff: M. Schroeder)
- 30 CARSON B. COX, TRUSTEE OF THE REVOCABLE TRUST AGREEMENT OF CARSON B. COX DATED NOVEMBER 13, 1999

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- (LESSEE): Consider amendment to Lease 9270, a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Corte Madera Creek, adjacent to 43 Greenbrae Boardwalk, near Greenbrae, Marin County; to eliminate two pilings erroneously included in the lease improvements and replace Exhibit A, Land Description, and Exhibit B, Site and Location Map. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (Lease 9270; A2774) (A 10; S 2) (Staff: V. Caldwell)
- 31 DRILL HOLDINGS, LLC (LESSEE); AND JANAK K. MEHTANI AND NALINI MEHTANI (APPLICANT): Consider termination of Lease PRC 8746, a General Lease - Recreational and Protective Structure Use; Void Invoice Number 49845 and any associated Penalty and Interest; and an application for a General Lease - Recreational and Protective Structure Use, of sovereign land located in the Sacramento River, adjacent to 3997 Garden Highway, near Sacramento, Sacramento County; for an existing boat dock, appurtenant facilities, and bank protection. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 8746; A2698; RA# 2020026) (A 7; S 6) (Staff: J. Holt)
- 32 DELIA L. GRINZEWITSCH, TRUSTEE OF THE GRINZEWITSCH SACRAMENTO 1 YR RESIDENTIAL TRUST, DATED DECEMBER 28, 2012, AND GEORGE A. GRINZEWITSCH JR., TRUSTEE OF THE DELIA L. GRINZEWITSCH 2012 NONEXEMPT TRUST, DATED DECEMBER 28, 2012 (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational and Protective Structure Use, of sovereign land located in the Sacramento River, adjacent to 4141 Garden Highway, Sacramento, Sacramento County; for an existing boat dock, appurtenant facilities, and bank protection. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 7817; A2796; RA#2020078) (A 7; S 6) (Staff: V. Caldwell)
- 33 PATRICK HINRICHSEN AND JULIEANNE HINRICHSEN (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational and Protective Structure Use of sovereign land located in the Sacramento River, adjacent to 949 Piedmont Drive, Sacramento, Sacramento County; for an existing boat dock, appurtenant facilities, and bank protection. CEQA Consideration:

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- categorical exemption. (Lease 6901; A2636; RA#2019339)
(A 7; S 6) (Staff: V. Caldwell)
- 34 JENNIFER D. HITCHCOCK, TRUSTEE OF THE JENNIFER D. HITCHCOCK LIVING TRUST DATED AUGUST 4, 1999 (LESSEE): Consider amendment to Lease 9287, a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Corte Madera Creek, adjacent to 47 Greenbrae Boardwalk, Greenbrae, Marin County; to add two existing pilings erroneously included on an adjacent lease by replacing Exhibit A, Land Description, and Exhibit B, Site and Location Map. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (Lease 9287; A2773) (A 10; S 2) (Staff: V. Caldwell)
- 35 WILLIAM C. KELLEY AND MAE ANDERSON-KELLEY (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational and Protective Structure Use, of sovereign land located in the Sacramento River, adjacent to 6051 Garden Highway, near Sacramento, Sacramento County; for an existing covered boat dock, bank protection, and appurtenant facilities not previously authorized by the Commission. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 5351; A2736; RA# 2020044) (A 7; S 6) (Staff: V. Caldwell)
- 36 JACK DURELL KELP AND CANDICE DEAK KELP, AS CO-TRUSTEES AND ANY SUCCESSOR TRUSTEES OF THE KELP FAMILY 2011 AB REVOCABLE TRUST, CREATED APRIL 14, 2011 (LESSEE); JAMES RUSSELL KAGY AND PAULA KAGY AS TRUSTEES OF THE KAGY FAMILY TRUST DATED 4/26/2013 (APPLICANT): Consider termination of Lease PRC 6684, a General Lease - Recreational Use; and an application for a General Lease - Recreational and Protective Structure Use, of sovereign land located in Georgiana Slough, adjacent to 431 W. Willow Tree Lane, near Isleton, Sacramento County; for an existing boat dock, appurtenant facilities, and one unattached piling previously authorized by the Commission and existing bank protection not previously authorized by the Commission. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 6684; A2724; RA# 2020043) (A 11; S 3) (Staff: J. Holt)
- 37 MARIN COUNTY FLOOD CONTROL AND WATER CONSERVATION DISTRICT (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Public Agency Use of sovereign land in

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- Corte Madera Creek from the Bon Air Bridge to San Pablo Bay, near Larkspur, Marin County; for a flood control channel. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 3485; A2818; RA# 2020068) (A 10; S 2) (Staff: A. Franzoia)
- 38 RONALD E. MULLER, AS TRUSTEE OF THE GM FAMILY REVOCABLE TRUST, DATED JANUARY 13, 2001 (LESSEE); PATRICK RUBIN AND SHELLY MILLER (APPLICANT): Consider termination of Lease No. PRC 5077, a General Lease - Recreational Use; and an application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in the Sacramento River, adjacent to 5601 Garden Highway, near Sacramento, Sacramento County; for an existing boat dock, gangway, stairs and two pilings previously authorized by the Commission and one existing piling not previously authorized by the Commission. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 5077; A2251; RA# 2019073) (A 7; S 6) (Staff: D. Tutov)
- 39 ROBERT PEARSON AND MARTHA PEARSON (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational and Protective Structure Use, of sovereign land located in the Sacramento River, adjacent to 17392 Grand Island Road, near Walnut Grove, Sacramento County; for an existing boat dock with slip and ramp previously authorized by the Commission and an existing three-pile dolphin and bank protection not previously authorized by the Commission. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 4781; A2707; RA# 2020015) (A 11; S 3) (Staff: J. Holt)
- 40 WESTPORT OFFICE PARK, LLC, A DELAWARE LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANY (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Right-of-Way Use and authorization of an Agreement and Consent to Encumbrance of Lease of sovereign land located in Belmont Slough, adjacent to 1400 and 1600 Bridge Parkway, near Redwood City, San Mateo County; for two existing stormwater outfalls and rock riprap. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 7876; A2208; RA# 2019041) (A 22; S 13) (Staff: D. Tutov)
- 41 TODD WILSON AND BRANDY WILSON (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational and

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- Protective Structure Use, of sovereign land located in the Sacramento River, adjacent to 5721 Garden Highway, near Sacramento, Sacramento County; for existing bank protection; and construction of a covered boat dock with slip and boat lift, gangway, and three pilings. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemptions. (Lease 6538; RA# 14318) (A 7; S 6) (Staff: J. Holt)
- 42 WOODBRIDGE IRRIGATION DISTRICT (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Public Agency Use, of sovereign land located in the Mokelumne River, near Woodbridge, San Joaquin County; for a fish bypass pipeline. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 3818; A2641; RA# 2019322) (A 9; S 5) (Staff: D. Tutov)
- 43 JUN KAI ZHENG AND YING FU ZHENG; NELSON ZHENG; AND SUHAN ZHENG (APPLICANT): Consider rescission of approval and issuance of a General Lease - Recreational and Protective Structure Use, of sovereign land located in the Sacramento River, adjacent to 105 Edgewater Drive, near Rio Vista, Solano County; for an existing wooden deck, boat dock, appurtenant facilities, and bank protection. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 9300; A2382; RA#2019198) (A 11; S 3) (Staff: G. Asimakopoulos)

Central / Southern Region

- 44 CONRAD G. BANKS AND CATHERINE V. BANKS, TRUSTEES OF THE CONRAD G. BANKS AND CATHERINE V. BANKS INTER VIVOS REVOCABLE TRUST, DATED NOVEMBER 7, 1980 (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in the Midway Channel of Huntington Harbour, adjacent to 3372 Gilbert Drive, Huntington Beach, Orange County; for an existing boat dock, access ramp, and cantilevered deck. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 4637; A2572; RA# 2020005) (A 72; S 34) (Staff: K. Connor)
- 45 PETER AND SARAH BATES (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Protective Structure Use, of sovereign land located adjacent to 403 Pacific Avenue, Solana Beach, San Diego County; for a portion

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- of a seawall. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (A2601; RA# 2019338) (A 78; S 29) (Staff: D. Simpkin)
- 46 RUSSELL JOSEPH CHIDLEY AND SUSAN ELIZABETH CHIDLEY (LESSEE): Consider amendment of Lease No. PRC 9062, a General Lease - Protective Structure Use, of sovereign land located in the Colorado River adjacent to 1190 Beach Drive, Needles, San Bernardino County; for a boat dock, stairway, and appurtenant facilities. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 9062; A2739; RA#2020063) (A 33; S 16) (Staff: L. Pino)
- 47 DAVID LEE JOHNSTON AND LISA D. JOHNSTON, TRUSTEES OF THE DLJ TRUST DATED DECEMBER 20, 2005 (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in Huntington Harbour, adjacent to 16212 Piedmont Circle, Huntington Beach, Orange County; for a portion of an existing common boat dock. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 7422; A2606; RA# 2020018) (A 72; S 34) (Staff: K. Connor)
- 48 PAUL NIKOLAU AND JOYCE NIKOLAU, AS TRUSTEES OF THE NIKOLAU LIVING TRUST, DATED SEPTEMBER 13, 2005 (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in the Midway Channel of Huntington Harbour, adjacent to 3382 Gilbert Drive, Huntington Beach, Orange County; for an existing boat dock and access ramp previously authorized by the Commission, and an existing cantilevered deck not previously authorized by the Commission. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 3083; A2746; RA# 2020038) (A 72; S 34) (Staff: K. Connor)
- 49 RIVERSIDE COUNTY REGIONAL PARK & OPEN-SPACE DISTRICT (LESSEE/SUBLESSOR); COVE RV RESORTS ON THE COLORADO RIVER, LLC (SUBLESSEE): Consider amendment of a General Lease - Commercial Use, endorsement of sublease, and revision of rent for Lease No. PRC 9128, of sovereign land located in the Historic Bed of the Colorado River adjacent to 500 Riviera Drive, Blythe, Riverside County; for an existing RV Park. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (Lease 9128; A2738; RA# 2020040) (A 56; S 28) (Staff: L. Pino)

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- 50 SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON COMPANY AND SAN DIEGO GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Right-of-Way Use, of sovereign land located in the Pacific Ocean, San Onofre, San Diego County; for two existing non-operational offshore concrete water circulating conduits associated with San Onofre Nuclear Generating Station (SONGS) Unit 1. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 3193; A2685; RA# 2019347) (A 76; S 36) (Staff: C. Hudson)
- 51 THE MUHS 1992 PARTNERSHIP, A CALIFORNIA GENERAL PARTNERSHIP (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Lease - Recreational Use, of sovereign land located in the Main Channel of Huntington Harbour adjacent to 16901 Bolero Lane, Huntington Beach, Orange County; for an existing boat dock, access ramp, and cantilevered deck. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 3577; A2579; RA# 2020066) (A 72; S 34) (Staff: L. Pino)

School Lands

- 52 IP ATHOS, LLC AND IP ATHOS II, LLC (APPLICANT): Consider amendment to Lease No. PRC 9579, a General Lease - Right-of-Way Use, of State-owned school land located in Section 16, Township 5 South, Range 16 East, SBM, northeast of Desert Center, Riverside County; to change the name of the Lessee, add a second overhead transmission line to the authorized uses, and extend the lease term. CEQA Consideration: Environmental Impact Report, certified by Riverside County, State Clearinghouse No. 2018051021. (PRC 9579.2; A2514; RA# 2019221) (A 56; S 28) (Staff: R. Collins)

Mineral Resources Management

- 53 AVANGRID RENEWABLES, LLC (APPLICANT): Consider application for a Non-Exclusive Geological/Geophysical Survey Permit on State-owned school lands, Assessor's Parcel Numbers 0417-162-01, 0417-162-02, 0417-162-04, 0417-162-05, 0417-162-053, 0417-162-54, located near Lucerne Valley, San Bernardino County. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (A2753; RA# 2020045) (A 7; S 6) (Staff: R. B. Greenwood)

INDEX CONTINUED

- PAGE
- 54 EGS AMERICAS, INC. (APPLICANT): Consider application for a General Offshore Geophysical Survey Permit to conduct geophysical surveys on granted and ungranted tide and submerged lands statewide, from the mean high tide line to 3 nautical miles offshore, under the jurisdiction of the California State Lands Commission. CEQA Consideration: Mitigated Negative Declaration, Mitigation Monitoring Program, and addendum, State Clearinghouse No. 2013072021. (A2844; RA# 2020099) (A & S: Statewide) (Staff: R. B. Greenwood)

Marine Environmental Protection - see Regular Calendar

Administration - no items

Legal

- 55 CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION (PARTY): Consider authorizing the Executive Officer, or her designee, to execute the Memorandum of Understanding relating to the Refugio Beach Oil Spill Natural Resources Damage Assessment and Restoration; and authorize staff to participate in the Refugio Beach Oil Spill Trustee Council. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (A & S: Statewide) (Staff: P. Huber)
- 56 CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION, OCEAN PROTECTION COUNCIL, CALIFORNIA NATURAL RESOURCES AGENCY, CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF FISH AND WILDLIFE, CALIFORNIA FISH AND GAME COMMISSION, CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION, STATE WATER RESOURCES CONTROL BOARD, CALIFORNIA COASTAL COMMISSION, CALIFORNIA OCEAN SCIENCE TRUST, MPA COLLABORATIVE NETWORK, RESOURCES LEGACY FUND (PARTIES): Consider authorizing the Executive Officer, or her designee, to execute a Memorandum of Understanding among the State Lands Commission, Ocean Protection Council, California Natural Resources Agency, California Department of Fish and Wildlife, California Fish and Game Commission, California Department of Parks and Recreation, State Water Resources Control Board, California Coastal Commission, California Ocean Science Trust, MPA Collaborative Network, and Resources Legacy Fund, relating to implementation of the California Marine Life Protection Act. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (A & S: Statewide) (Staff: J. Mattox, B. Johnson)

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

Kapiloff Land Bank Trust Acquisition/Expenditure

- 57 CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION, IN ITS CAPACITY AS THE KAPILOFF LAND BANK TRUSTEE: Consider authorizing the Executive Officer to expend up to \$37,500 from the Kapiloff Land Bank Fund and to enter into a Local Government Agreement with the County of Ventura to construct a bollard fence adjacent to a state-owned access road and parking area for the La Jenelle Beach Park, near Port Hueneme, Ventura County. CEQA Consideration: categorical exemption. (Lease 4951) (A 44; S 19) (Staff: C. Connor, K. Foster, A. Kershen)

External Affairs

Granted Lands

- 58 CITY OF LONG BEACH (TRUSTEE): Review a proposed tideland oil revenue expenditure in an amount not to exceed \$2,588,989 by the City of Long Beach for four capital improvement projects located both on and adjacent to legislatively granted sovereign land in the City of Long Beach, Los Angeles County. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (G 05-03) (A 70; S 33) (Staff: M. Moser)
- 59 CITY OF MARTINEZ (TRUSTEE): Consider temporarily relieving the City of Martinez from its requirement to transmit 20 percent of the revenue generated from its granted lands to the State. CEQA Consideration: not a project. (G 02-02) (A 11; S 7) (Staff: M. Moser)

VI Informational Calendar - see Regular Calendar

VII Regular Calendar 60-64

- 60 CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION (INFORMATIONAL): Informational update on efforts to develop the Commission's 2021-2025 Strategic Plan and to solicit comments and suggestions from stakeholders. CEQA Consideration: not applicable. (A & S: Statewide) (Staff: C. Connor, J. Lucchesi, B. Stoddard, K. Robinson-Filipp)

53

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

61	CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION (PARTY): Consider approval of the legislative report titled "2021 Biennial Report on the California Marine Invasive Species Program." CEQA Consideration: not a project. (W9777.234) (A & S: Statewide) (Staff: L. Ceballos Osuna, N. Dobroski)	94
62	CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION (INFORMATIONAL): Progress report on the Commission's second year implementing its new Environmental Justice Policy. CEQA Consideration: not applicable. (A & S: Statewide) (Staff: Y. Ramirez, S. Pemberton)	105
63	CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION (INFORMATIONAL): Informational update on aquaculture in State and federal waters, including the establishment of Aquaculture Opportunity Areas in federal waters. CEQA Consideration: not applicable. (A & S: Statewide) (Staff: M. Danielson)	
64	CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION (INFORMATIONAL): Informational update on AB 691 (Muratsuchi) Chapter 592, statutes of 2013; Public Resources Code section 6311.5 relating to legislatively granted Public Trust lands and sea-level rise planning. CEQA Consideration: not applicable. (A & S: Statewide) (Staff: K. Kunkel)	125
VIII	Public Comment	144
IX	Commissioners' Comments	148
X	Closed Session	154

At any time during the meeting the Commission may
meet in a session of Government Code section
11126, part of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

A. Litigation.

The Commission may consider pending and possible litigation pursuant to the confidentiality of attorney-client communications and privileges provided under Government Code section 11126, subdivision (e).

1. The Commission may consider pending and possible matters that fall under Government Code section 11126, subdivision (e)(2)(A), concerning adjudicatory proceedings before a court, an administrative body exercising its adjudicatory authority, a hearing officer, or an arbitrator, to which the Commission is a party. Such matters currently include the following:
 - California Coastkeeper Alliance, California Coastal Protection v. California State Lands Commission
 - California State Lands Commission v. Signal Hill Service, Inc.; Pacific Operators, Inc., dba Pacific Operators Offshore, Inc.; DOES 1-100
 - California State Lands Commission, et al. v. Martins Beach 1 LLC, et al.
 - City of Vallejo v. The State of California, By and Through the State Lands Commission
 - Eugene Davis v. State of California and California State Lands Commission
 - In re: HVI Cat Canyon, Inc., Bankruptcy Chapter 11
 - In re: PG&E Corporation and Pacific Gas and Electric Company, Bankruptcy Chapter 11
 - In re: Rincon Island Limited Partnership Chapter 7
 - In re: Temblor Petroleum Company, LLC, Bankruptcy Chapter 11
 - In re: Venoco, LLC, Bankruptcy Chapter 11
 - John W. Lebolt and Richard A. Lebolt v. City and County of San Francisco
 - Madden v. City of Redwood City
 - Martins Beach 1, LLC and Martins Beach 2, LLC v. Effie Turnbull-Sanders, et al.
 - Oakland Bulk and Oversized Terminal, LLC v. City of Oakland

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

- Owens Valley Committee v. City of Los Angeles, Los Angeles Department of Water and Power, et al.
 - Public Watchdogs v. California State Lands Commission
 - San Francisco Baykeeper, Inc. v. State Lands Commission
 - San Joaquin River Exchange Contractors Water Authority v. State of California; State Lands Commission
 - State of California v. International Boundary and Water Commission, et al.
 - State Lands Commission v. Plains Pipeline, L.P., et al.
 - United States v. Walker River Irrigation District, et al.
2. The Commission may consider matters that fall under Government Code section 11126, subdivision (e)(2)(b), under which;
- a. A point has been reached where, in the opinion of the Commission, on the advice of its legal counsel, based on existing facts and circumstances, there is a significant exposure to litigation against the Commission, or
 - b. Based on existing facts and circumstances, the Commission is meeting only to decide whether a closed session is authorized because of a significant exposure to litigation against the Commission.
3. The Commission may consider matters that fall under Government Code section 11126, subdivision (e)(2)(C), where, based on existing facts and circumstances, the state body has decided to initiate or is deciding whether to initiate litigation.
- B. Conference with real property negotiators. The Commission may consider matters that fall under Government Code section 11126, subdivision (c)(7), under which, prior to the purchase sale, exchange, or lease of real property by or for the

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE

Commission, the directions may be given to its negotiators regarding price and terms of payment for the purchase, sale, exchange, or lease. At the time of publication of this Agenda, it is not anticipated that the Commission will discuss any such matters; however, at the time of the scheduled meeting, a discussion of any such matter may be necessary or appropriate.

C. Other matters.

The Commission may also consider personnel actions to appoint, employ, or dismiss a public employee as provided for in Government Code section 11126(A)(1).

Adjournment	155
Reporter's Certificate	156

PROCEEDINGS

CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, everyone. Thank you for joining us this morning. The hour of 10 o'clock having arrived on Thursday, December 17th, 2020, I call this meeting of the State Lands Commission to order. I'm State Controller Betty Yee. And welcome to our completely virtual State Lands Commission meeting.

Ms. Lucchesi, will you please call the roll of the Commissioners in attendance.

EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Certainly.

Lieutenant Eleni Governor Kounalakis?

COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Present.

EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Gayle Miller representing the Department of Finance?

ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: Present.

EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Chair and State Controller Betty Yee?

CHAIRPERSON YEE: Here.

EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Madam Chair, we have a quorum present.

In addition, I would like to identify the members of the staff of this commission and the Attorney General present for this virtual meeting.

I am Executive Officer Jennifer Lucchesi. I'm here with Chief Counsel Seth Blackmon; Meeting Liaison Kim

1 Lunetta; Assistant Executive Officer Colin Connor;
2 Supervising Deputy Attorney General Andrew Vogel; and our
3 Zoom Co-hosts Katie Robinson-Filipp, Mike Farinha, and
4 Phil Schlatter.

5 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Thank you very much.

6 For the benefit of those joining us virtually, the
7 State Lands Commission manages State property interests in
8 over 5 million acres of land including mineral interests.
9 The Commission also has responsibility for the prevention
10 of oil spills at marine oil terminals and offshore oil
11 platforms and for preventing the introduction of marine
12 invasive species into California's marine waters.

13 Today, we will hear requests and presentations
14 involving the lands and resources within the Commission's
15 jurisdiction.

16 We recognize that the lands we manage have been
17 inhabited for thousands of years by California's native
18 people, and take seriously our trust relationship with
19 these sovereign governments.

20 I want to take a moment to honor the California
21 Native American communities all across the State for
22 persisting, carrying on diverse cultural and linguistic
23 traditions and sustainably managing the lands that we now
24 share.

25 Native people have maintained a constant presence

1 on the landscape for many thousands of years, and they are
2 essential stewardship partners whether along the coast,
3 along our rivers and valleys, or in our fragile deserts.

4 We thank California Native American communities
5 for participating in the Commission's activities and for
6 their essential role in maintaining and adding to our
7 state's rich cultural legacy.

8 The next item of business will be public comment.
9 Before I open the public comment period up for items not
10 on the agenda, first let me thank everyone, especially our
11 stakeholders and members of the public for taking the time
12 to join our virtual meeting.

13 While these virtual meetings are becoming more
14 routine, this is still a relatively new experience for
15 most of us, and we appreciate your support and patience as
16 we work together in this new medium.

17 Now I want to turn it over to Ms. Lucchesi to
18 quickly share some instructions about how we can best
19 participate in this meeting so that it runs as smoothly as
20 possible.

21 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Thank you, Chair
22 Yee.

23 First, everyone, please make sure you have your
24 microphones on muted to avoid any background noise.

25 For members of the public, if you would like to

1 speak either during our open public comment period or
2 during a public comment period that is part of an agenda
3 item, you will need to do so in one of two ways. First,
4 if you are attending on the Zoom platform, please raise
5 your hand in Zoom. If you new to Zoom, and you joined our
6 meeting using the Zoom application, click on the hand icon
7 at the bottom of your screen. When you click on that
8 hand, it will raise your hand.

9 Second, if you are joining our meeting by phone,
10 you must press star nine on your keypad to raise your hand
11 to make a comment. If you are calling in and want to view
12 the meeting including the PowerPoint presentations, please
13 view the meeting through the CAL-SPAN live webcast link.
14 There will be a slight time delay, but it will avoid an
15 echo or feedback from using the Zoom application and your
16 phone.

17 If you emailed us with a request to speak, please
18 also raise your hand so we don't inadvertently miss you.
19 We will call on individuals who have raised their hands in
20 the order that they are raised, using the name they
21 registered with or the last three digits of their
22 identifying phone number. After you're called on, you
23 will be unmuted so you can share your comments.

24 Please also remember (inaudible) computer or
25 phone and identify yourselves.

1 Remember, you have a limit of 3 minutes to speak
2 on an item. Please keep your comments respectful and
3 focused. We will mute anyone who fails to follow those
4 guidelines, or at worst dismiss them from the meeting.

5 Finally, every now and then you will hear me
6 refer to our meeting host. Our Commission staff are
7 acting as hosts for the meeting behind the scenes to
8 ensure that the technology moves the meeting forward
9 smoothly and consistently.

10 The Commission has also established an email
11 address to compile public comments for our meetings. Its
12 address is cslc.commissionmeetings@slc.ca.gov.

13 We have received various emails from parties that
14 have been shared with all the commissioners prior to the
15 meeting. If we receive any emails during the meeting,
16 they will be shared with the commissioners and be made
17 available on our website at www.slc.ca.gov, along with the
18 public comment emails and letters we have already
19 received.

20 Chair Yee, that concludes my virtual meeting
21 instructions. We are ready to move to the general public
22 comment period.

23 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Ms. Lucchesi.

24 And before we move on, I just wanted to just make
25 an announcement, an introduction of Mary Anne Warmerdam,

1 who is the Deputy Controller for Environmental Policy just
2 recently joining us. And you will likely be seeing much
3 more of her in the future.

4 Welcome, Mary-Ann.

5 So our next order of business is the public
6 comment period. If anyone wishes to address the
7 Commission on any matter not on today's agenda, please
8 raise your hand and you will have 3 minutes to do so.

9 I'll now turn to Katie to see if she would please
10 call on the first person who would like to make a public
11 comment.

12 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Thank
13 you, Chair Yee.

14 The first person making a comment during general
15 public comment will be Lisa Levinson followed by Marcia
16 Hanscom.

17 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you.

18 Good morning, Lisa.

19 MS. LEVINSON: Good morning, and thank you very
20 much. I'm excited to be here today.

21 Just waiting for my computer here for a second.
22 Sorry about that.

23 Okay. Great.

24 Well, thanks again for inviting public comments.
25 I'm Lisa Levinson with In Defense of Animals, an

1 international animal protection nonprofit, with 250,000
2 supporters and 25,000 in California.

3 12,000 of our supporters signed petitions to
4 protect Ballona Wetlands and stop the counterfeit
5 restoration project that would bulldoze the area. Just
6 last week, Defend Ballona Wetlands announced their new
7 gentle restoration plan to foster species recovery and
8 improve public access without bulldozing the reserve. We
9 love the gentle restoration plan because it forms recovery
10 teams to recover road runner, Jack rabbit, California
11 Quail, horned lizard, garter snake, bald eagle, snow
12 goose, sandhill crane, and Southern California sea otters
13 to Ballona.

14 We also like the implementation of docent and
15 youth ranger programs to teach respect and sustainability
16 principles. Please read the 20-point plan at
17 defendballonawetlands.org.

18 Bulldozing Ballona would destroy the habitat for
19 rare white-tailed kites. Two to three of these majestic
20 raptors currently forage in the Ballona grasslands, one of
21 the most diminished California habitats.

22 Gentle restoration can accomplish all of the
23 goals of the counterfeit restoration, except refurbishing
24 the gas storage facilities beneath the wetlands.
25 Residents fear another Aliso Canyon blowout in their

1 neighborhood. They want gas out of Ballona and so do we.

2 Thank you for your time.

3 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you much, Lisa for
4 joining us.

5 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Then our next --

6 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: The
7 next speaker is Mar -- oh, pardon me.

8 CHAIRPERSON YEE: That's okay, Katie. Please.

9 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Our
10 next speaker is Marcia Hanscom.

11 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Marcia.

12 MS. HANSCOM: Good morning, Commissioner -- or,
13 let's see, State Lands Commissioners, yes. Whether people
14 are commissioners or board members, it's always a
15 challenge in these virtual meetings.

16 But I want to say first, I'm so grateful for your
17 commission, because I tell other agency people all the
18 time, watch the State Lands Commission meetings, because
19 they are conducted in a way that helps the public really
20 understand the way the Commission works. And so I really
21 appreciate all that you and your leadership, Chair Yee,
22 and the rest of the Commissioners and your staff conduct
23 these meetings.

24 I also want to say and draw to your attention the
25 alternative number 4, the gentle alternative for the

1 Ballona Wetlands, a 20-point plan that was released last
2 week, put together by a number of community members, and
3 with the advice and counsel of a couple of really good
4 biologists who know how to do recovery plans and how to do
5 work in a sensitive ecological reserve area, which this
6 is.

7 And we will be sending you copies of that plan
8 and hope that you will take the time to read it. And we
9 would love for the State Lands Commission to consider
10 taking a position on this.

11 The other three alternatives that are being
12 considered by the state at the moment are highly
13 destructive and would actually harm the species that the
14 State spent \$140 million for protecting in 2003.

15 And I also -- I want to read the first point of
16 the 20-point plan, because you made me think of it right
17 away, Chair Yee, when you opened the meeting. Because
18 this is one of the most important things we can do. One,
19 form an indigenous tribal council for Ballona, consisting
20 of elders for the indigenous people for the LA coast,
21 which would guide protection decisions for the land and
22 which would be given access for historical life ways to
23 activities, such as gathering for prayers, and other
24 spiritual, religious sacred ceremonies, and gathering
25 plants for medicinal and basketry purposes.

1 This has not been done in many of the State
2 ecological reserves, and we really need to have that be
3 first and foremost in our protected lands, and
4 particularly at Ballona, where hundreds of ancestors were
5 dug up in a terrible, terrible project across the street
6 from the ecological reserve when the Playa Vista
7 development was built.

8 So we hope you will again read this alternative
9 plan and that you will embrace it as we have, and that you
10 will inform the Governor that this might be a much better
11 way to solve things and move forward at the Ballona
12 wetlands.

13 Thank you so much.

14 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Marcia,
15 for bringing that forward.

16 Katie, our next speaker?

17 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP:

18 [Unintelligible] Chair Yee, our next speaker is
19 Christina Ku.

20 MS. KU: Hello there?

21 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Christina.

22 MS. KU: Hi. Good morning, everybody. Wow, it's
23 a privilege to speak with you esteemed folks. You know,
24 I'm a mem -- my name's Christina Ku and I'm one of the
25 founding members of the L.A. County Democratic Party new

1 charter club. It's called Democrats for the Protection of
2 Animals. And our main mission is to promote humane
3 treatment of animals and also promote humane legislation
4 and government policies on animal protection issues at
5 city, state, and federal levels.

6 So we -- we've been working on the Ballona
7 Wetlands Ecological Reserve issue. I don't know how much
8 you know about it. But, you know, we're finding out new
9 information every day about ways that this area, 640 acres
10 of beautiful, you know, wilderness wetland, is facing some
11 major challenges.

12 And, you know, there's the SoCalGas gas tanks
13 that are underneath it. And this whole situation why so
14 many people are getting involved is that we're finding out
15 that they -- they're trying to reestablish at the wells
16 and to refurbish them and putting in pipes and upgrading
17 them. And so they've proposed to basically, you know,
18 uplift and remove the whole wetlands area. And that is
19 pretty shocking, because any ecologist, environmentalist,
20 and animal welfare expert will tell you that that means
21 destruction.

22 And what's really heartbreaking is that big
23 companies like SoCalGas is phrasing this in a way that is
24 really misleading the public. They've got weekly ads,
25 large one-page advertisements that is using words that are

1 misleading the public.

2 And they're colorful ads that say -- they're
3 calling it removing -- they're helping the wetlands by
4 removing these gas wells. Well, guess what, folks? What
5 they're leaving out is that they are removing, which is
6 excavating the whole area, the wetlands, the wildlife, all
7 the nature, and they're also going to put new ones in
8 surrounding areas.

9 So they say "remove," but they didn't put in, "By
10 the way, we're going to dig up more land and put new ones
11 in."

12 So it's an oxymoron. And we really want folks to
13 realize that, learn on that, so we need your help. This
14 is what we're facing. And there are just -- there are
15 hundreds, thousands -- 1700 different kinds of species of
16 animals and plants there that need your help; and we're
17 really speaking on their behalf.

18 So thank you for listening.

19 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Christina.
20 Katie, our next speaker?

21 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Next
22 speaker is Mary Beth Trautwein.

23 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Mary Beth.

24 MS. TRAUTWEIN: Good morning. My name's Mary
25 Beth Trautwein. I'm a 20-plus-year resident of Venice,

1 and I'm an active kayaker and biker in the Marina and
2 Playa del Rey areas.

3 I would just for the sake of time like to
4 emphasize what Lisa Levinson said about the Ballona
5 Wetlands, that 25,000 people have expressed concern about
6 the treatment of animals and the need for the ecological
7 reserve; and also to laud Marcia Hanscom's long-time work
8 in bringing you, Betty Yee, to the wetlands as well as
9 seeing to the importance gentle restoration (inaudible);
10 and that the defendballonawetlands.org, the 20-point plan
11 for a gentle restoration, for me particularly I love that
12 option because in response to a 10-year plan from the
13 California Department of Fish and Wildlife in their
14 environmental impact report where they suggest taking
15 plants away with heavy machinery, essentially destroying
16 the nature that is there, to only replace it 10 years
17 later, is not really a way to, in my view, be consistent
18 with what our Governor's calling for nature-based
19 solutions to climate change, and then also just the harm
20 that it will do to the neighborhood and the wetlands.

21 And then also to emphasize what the previous
22 speaker said about SoCalGas. I don't know if she
23 mentioned, Mike Bonin, our city councilman; our State
24 Senator Ben Allen; and our County Supervisor Janice Hahn,
25 have all called on either for a motion to explore or

1 contacted the Governor about removing equipment in the
2 wetlands and the gas storage facility there.

3 This is of great concern to me. In January of
4 2019, there was a blowout at a construction site in the
5 marina. This has still gone unaddressed as far as I know.

6 And then also, as dangerous as blowouts are, it's
7 also the continued exposure to the chemicals stored at the
8 gas plant facility. The gas stored there is fracked gas.
9 It's come to the wetlands to be stored. And groups like
10 the Physicians for Social Responsibility have expressed
11 alarm at the human -- at the health causes of chemicals
12 used in fracked gas.

13 These are being shipped to our neighborhood and
14 being stored there, and there are leaks. Many studies
15 have been coming out recently about methane, ethylene, and
16 many other -enes, chemicals that just are simply not
17 compatible to human health.

18 So I call on the Board to consider these things.
19 I know that oil and gas facilities are an important part
20 of California's revenue in the past, but it's time to move
21 away.

22 Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Mary Beth.
24 Katie, our next speaker?

25 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Our

1 next speaker is Lisa Karlan.

2 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Lisa.

3 MS. KARLAN: Good morning, everybody. Thank you
4 so much for having us speak during public comment,
5 esteemed members of this particular Commission, this Lands
6 Commission. My name is Lisa Karlan. I'm an activist and
7 I represent a group of individuals seeking to defend the
8 Ballona Wetlands.

9 I just wanted to -- it's been mentioned before,
10 but I just want to reiterate that the proposed project at
11 the Ballona Wetlands is not a restoration. It's a misuse
12 of the term and it's designed to confuse. And the theme
13 of my discussion this morning is about confusion, because
14 that's how some industries get things done. They confuse
15 the public. They confuse people that are -- that think
16 they're doing the right thing, and they're not.

17 The purpose of this restoration is to help
18 Southern California Gas maintain a storage facility that
19 exists under the 640 acres of the Ballona Wetlands. And
20 this storage area, these are fossil fuels. We're moving
21 away from fossil fuels. Why are we putting the millions
22 of dollars that were obtained through various bond
23 measures into restoring something that should just be
24 sealed off permanently and no longer available for
25 storage? Because what they want to do is bulldoze it,

1 basically erase all the land, all the live -- all of the
2 animals that live there, all the wildlife, especially the
3 endangered species. That's why Marcia Hanscom spoke about
4 having biologists on this team. We want you to look at
5 our -- at our very gentle - Item Number 4 - restoration.
6 There's 20 points. I'm going to read one section very
7 quickly. This is point number 6.

8 "While there are already 1700 species present at
9 Ballona, including some endangered and threatened, work
10 with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and the California
11 Department of Fish and Wildlife to form recovery teams to
12 recover this ecological reserve. The following species:

13 "Animals: Road runner, Jack rabbit, California
14 Quail, horned lizard, garter snake.

15 "Plants: Ballona cinquefoil, salt marsh bird's
16 beak.

17 "And to determine the feasibility of additional
18 species that would be compatible with those species
19 currently relying on this proposal."

20 The other thing I want to say is, just like the
21 tobacco companies used to say - and I was part of a team
22 that actually obtained this information through the
23 Freedom of Information Act -- the top of their -- their
24 paperwork said, "Remember, confusion is our product."
25 That appeared many, many times in the tobacco company's

1 defense. Confusion was the product. I don't want
2 confusion to be the product here. We want to save the
3 wildlife and preserve this ecological reserve at the
4 Ballona Wetlands.

5 Thank you very much.

6 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Lisa.
7 Katie, our next speaker?

8 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Our
9 next speaker is Susanne Cumming.

10 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Good morning, Susanne.

11 MS. CUMMING: Good morning. Good morning,
12 esteemed Commissioners.

13 My name is Susanne Cumming. I'm an attorney. I
14 live in Marina del Rey. And I'm a member of the Sierra
15 Club and Defend Ballona Wetlands.
16 I'm asking you to stop the bulldozing plan for the Ballona
17 Wetlands. The State Land Commission, your commission,
18 owns 60 acres here, but largely it's been left out of the
19 planning process. We ask you to get involved.
20 Please place on your agenda consideration for supporting
21 option 4, the gentle alternative that you've heard about;
22 or withdraw the defective EIR based on bad science. And
23 that's -- that's what the bulldozing plan is about, the
24 options 1 and 2, the bad science of the EIR.

25 You've heard about the thousands of wild animals and

1 plants living there that would be obliterated. The
2 bulldozing plan, if carried out, would wreak havoc on the
3 surrounding communities for nine years at a cost of 270
4 million public dollars.

5 A lawsuit has been filed. I'm sure you have
6 heard about it. It alleges murky connections between the
7 crumbling Southern California -- the storage facility that
8 you heard about under the wetlands, the State Coastal
9 Conservancy, the Bay Foundation, and a couple of other
10 high profile groups that support bulldozing.

11 The lawsuit alleges that this counterfeit
12 restoration is a pretext, with the real agenda of aiding
13 Southern California Gas that you've also heard about
14 today.

15 Although Southern California Gas denies it in
16 their extensive public media campaign, look at the EIR.
17 The facts are there this is what they're doing.

18 Elected officials have called for investigating
19 shutting down the storage facility, with the Aliso Canyon
20 disaster in mind.

21 Please support them.

22 I don't know if you know the bulldozing plan also
23 calls for a three-story parking garage on the wetlands.
24 There is reason to believe that there may be an
25 arrangement with a hotel developer nearby so that in

1 exchange for parking in the garage, a hotel can be built
2 up closer to the water.

3 The express language in Proposition 12, passed by
4 the voters in 2000 -- am I over my time? Almost.

5 CHAIRPERSON YEE: You have 15 seconds.

6 MS. CUMMING: Okay. Please support the gentle
7 option, gentle option 4, of the EIR so we can move
8 forward.

9 Thank you so much.

10 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Susanne.

11 Katie, our next speaker.

12 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Our
13 next speak is someone calling in with the last three
14 digits 983.

15 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Good morning.

16 Our next caller, if you can hear me, you're on.

17 Katie, perhaps we'll return to that caller. Is
18 that all right?

19 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Yes.

20 Yes. Thank you.

21 Our next speaker is Robert van de Hoek.

22 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great.

23 Good morning, Robert.

24 MR. VAN DE HOEK: Okay. Good morning. Thank you
25 so much for the opportunity to speak and helping me find

1 the "unmute" button that came up as a message, "Click
2 Here."

3 Happy Holidays to you. Thank you so much for
4 meeting during these difficult times of the COVID-19 virus
5 pandemic. And I hope that you and your families and staff
6 and the two commissioners are all staying safe. And I
7 appreciate that we're having the meetings virtually; and I
8 hope they continue this way after the virus, maybe some
9 combination of in-person meetings but also this way
10 because it really does a lot of access by the public to be
11 able to speak from home and not have to travel and
12 contribute to climate change in a vehicle.

13 Okay. I'm so fortunate that I've been able to
14 take both the Lieutenant Governor and the State Controller
15 on tours at the Ballona Wetlands. I'd like to continue
16 that tour here with you briefly in words, and relate to
17 the indigenous people's effort and the continuing journey
18 of a particular native plant. Although I am a wildlife
19 biologist, I have training in botany too. And there are
20 wildlife issues connected to this native plant, like
21 butter -- native butterflies and native bumblebees, and
22 that pollinate this flowering plant.

23 This plant is known in science and botanical
24 Latin as *Anemopsis californica*; and in Spanish, Yerba
25 mansa. And the Spanish derived the name from the Aztec

1 Indian peoples. The plant was known in Mexico but
2 transported by trade, women matrilineally bringing the
3 plant north into the United States region, into Arizona,
4 New Mexico, Texas, and finally to California.

5 This plant, Yerba mansa, is medicinal. It helps
6 with respiratory wounds, breathing. It helps with healing
7 wounds very quickly. So magical is this plant that women,
8 the grandmothers, mothers, daughters, all learned about
9 and how to transport this plant and keep it moist. It
10 needs watery -- it can grow in a bucket of water or a --
11 needs to be in wet soil. It can be a little bit salty
12 soil or completely fresh water soil.

13 The Paiute Indians in the Owens Valley had a name
14 for this plant. There were actually more than a hundred
15 indigenous names for this plant in the western North
16 America.

17 The plant has been at the Ballona Wetlands for
18 thousands of years, and was brought to the State Lands
19 Commission land by -- not by Native American women, but by
20 developers, and has planted kind of in violation of
21 respect for this plant in the fresh water, a detention
22 basin that the State Lands Commission owns and manages,
23 and needs a revolutionary reform management.

24 And that's just a little bit of the story.

25 Thank you.

1 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Robert, very much.
2 Our next speaker, Katie?

3 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Next
4 speaker is Contra Costa RCD.

5 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great.
6 Good morning.

7 MS. PETTY: Good morning. I'm Heidi Petty. I
8 work for the Contra Costa Resource Conservation District
9 as Watershed Program Manager. You've heard from me a
10 couple times about the Crockett waterfront.

11 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes.

12 MS. PETTY: I appreciate that you all had a
13 lovely meeting -- town hall meeting last week regarding
14 the Crockett Waterfront Project. And I just wanted to let
15 you know that we continue to work on this, and that I
16 actually have a grant in to help with the railroad
17 crossing, keeping it open for pedestrians and keeping it
18 available to the public. This has been, you know, as you
19 know, a dumping ground for many years. And we finally got
20 it all cleaned up between all of us putting in time and
21 money including the State Lands Commission putting in
22 \$400,000 to clean up old cars and such.

23 And now that it's clean, we are basically being
24 threatened with losing it because we can't afford the
25 pedestrian crossing upgrade. So we saw at the meeting

1 that there was a lot of funds available for cleanup,
2 removal of barges and some of the other things; and we're
3 just hoping that State Lands will consider taking some of
4 those funds and helping us to keep our railroad crossing
5 open so that this community can enjoy this beautiful
6 space, including the barge which I believe you have I
7 think \$380,000 to remove, which I am currently working
8 with Jonathan Todd to revamp into a beautiful planted,
9 potentially educational platform. And this may be just
10 something that California can use to revitalize these old
11 sunken barges.

12 So I would like you all to consider different
13 alternatives and possibilities to this barge situation and
14 these funding issues.

15 Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much for your
17 comments.

18 Katie, our next speaker?

19 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Next
20 speaker is Jane Velez-Mitchell.

21 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Jane.

22 MS. VELEZ-MITCHELL: Good morning. Thank you so
23 much for the opportunity to speak.

24 Let me see if I can put on the video, if I can.
25 Or is it just audio? Well, let me just proceed then.

1 In the early '90s I was a reporter at KCAL TV in
2 Los Angeles, so I covered a protest against Playa Vista,
3 led my Martin Sheen, including indigenous leaders, and I
4 spoke to the executives at Playa Vista and they assured me
5 in no uncertain terms that, don't worry, there will be an
6 area of the Ballona Wetlands that will remain pristine and
7 undisturbed. They said that to my face. They made a
8 promise to my face.

9 Here we are more than 20 years later, and there
10 is a plan to bulldoze that very land, the Ballona
11 Wetlands, 640 acres. It has been described as dead and
12 dying. But I live here, I walk through, I see all the
13 animals. And we have photographic evidence of 1,700
14 species, some endangered, some threatened, who are living
15 there and thriving there. And I see -- every day I see
16 the pelicans, I see the geese, I see the egrets, and I
17 know that we do not need to bulldoze this entire area to
18 achieve the legitimate goals of more public access. We're
19 all for more public access. Of course we want to see
20 people in this densely populated urban area have access.

21 That's why we'd like to see a gentle restoration,
22 which is option 4. And that option 4 has now been fleshed
23 out with 20-point plan that includes utilizing existing
24 trails, creating informational tours so that children
25 cannot just go there and see grass but they can actually

1 learn about the indigenous people who once called this
2 area home, and learn about the threatened and endangered
3 species that still exist there. We can unlock the gates.
4 We can plant native species in a mindful way. We can
5 clean up the perimeter so that it's beautified.

6 It's a detailed 20-point plan, and I just humbly
7 and respectfully urge you to consider it. In this time,
8 where wildlife and habitats are being destroyed due to
9 climate change and wildfires, we need to think 21st
10 Century. Bulldozing is 20th Century.

11 21st Century is really thinking about how to do
12 something in a sustainable, nature-based, mindful way.
13 And we all know killing is not conservation. Destruction
14 is not renovation or restoration. I urge you to avoid
15 bulldozing and think about a gentle, evolved plan for the
16 Ballona Wetlands.

17 Thank you so much for your time.

18 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Jane, very much.

19 Katie, Our next speaker?

20 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Next
21 speaker is America's Green Corps.

22 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Good morning.

23 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: It
24 appears that America's Green Corps is using an older
25 version of Zoom, and I am not able to give them permission

1 to unmute.

2 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay, Katie.

3 How about our next speaker, then.

4 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: For our
5 next speaker let's try the call-in number ending in 983
6 again.

7 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Good morning.

8 Katie, is there another speaker after the caller?

9 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Yes.

10 Yet it appears that the audio is not working for 983.

11 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay.

12 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: We also
13 had on the list for our speakers --

14 MS. MILLER: Hello.

15 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Somebody's just joined.
16 This is the caller.

17 Hello?

18 MS. MILLER: Hi. This is 5983. Is --

19 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes, you're on.

20 MS. MILLER: Oh, okay. Thank you. Sorry about
21 that.

22 CHAIRPERSON YEE: If you'll state your name for
23 the record, that would be great.

24 MS. MILLER: Yes. It's Patricia Miller, and I
25 live in Lakehead, California. I've been working with

1 Randy Collins on some adjacent land that you guys were
2 trying to get someone to come in and clean up the burnt
3 forest timber land. And I got a call from Randy, who's
4 done everything in his power I think to try and get this
5 accomplished. And he had a contractor that was willing to
6 do it, but the bid apparently is too high.

7 So I don't know how we're going to move forward,
8 because I've already got trees falling on our land.
9 Pretty large tree, one already. And I know there's going
10 to be many more because there's thousands of trees there.

11 So I don't know what the plan is to move forward.
12 What are we supposed to do? I mean I'm 60 years -- so I'm
13 66, my husband's 60. These trees are not something we can
14 physically just cut up and haul and put in piles and burn,
15 and I don't -- I don't know what to do. I don't know
16 where we are at this point.

17 And I'm a little disheartened because he told me
18 the next call I would get was the start date, you know;
19 and now it's been declined as too expensive, and I don't
20 know where we go from here.

21 So I'd like you to give me some advice on what to
22 do with the dead trees, the one that is already fallen.
23 And in the future, how am I supposed to dispose of them?
24 What am I supposed to do here? I just need some advice.

25 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Ms. Miller. We will

1 have somebody contact you.

2 Ms. Lucchesi, do you want to address that?

3 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Yes, I'm happy to
4 address that. And we'll continue to work with Ms. Miller,
5 and I'm grateful that she called in today.

6 We have had challenges, as the Commission knows
7 because we've talked about this (inaudible) in terms of
8 getting estimates and a contractor out there to conduct
9 debris and tree -- and shrub removal, vegetation removal.

10 The only estimate that we have received is
11 approximately \$450,000 to clear four acres. And as part
12 of our due diligence, as a fiduciary of these State funds,
13 we have been ground truthing essentially that estimate,
14 and we continue to do so with our partner agency Cal Fire.

15 So, you know, I know that this is incredibly
16 frustrating for Ms. Miller. We're thankful for her
17 patience. But we're still working through the cost
18 estimate, looking at what our options are, and really
19 trying to tap into our partner agencies who have a lot
20 more expertise, particularly when it comes to cost
21 estimates relating to this kind of work in this kind of
22 remote area with this type of terrain.

23 So I would just encourage Ms. Miller to continue
24 to be patient. I know that's hard. But we are continuing
25 to work through this challenging issue.

1 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Ms. Lucchesi. And
2 thank you, Ms. Miller, for bringing the issue forward; and
3 we will continue working with you to get it resolved.

4 Katie, our next speaker?

5 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Our
6 next speaker is someone calling in with the last three
7 digits 084.

8 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning.

9 Is our caller --

10 MR. DAVIS: Yes. Can you hear me?

11 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes, we can hear you.

12 Please identify yourself for the record, please.

13 MR. DAVIS: Okay. Hello and season's greetings,
14 Vice President Harris, California State Lands Commission,
15 tribal council leaders, people of the Central Coast, and
16 the University of California. My name is Ryan Davis and I
17 am the author of the unpublished America's Green
18 Reconstruction Plan, creator of Project First Light Lab,
19 and founder of America's Green Corps 501(c)(3).

20 We are a newly incorporated California-rooted,
21 not for profit. It is our mission to bridge the fossil
22 fuel industry with our construction of the renewable grid.
23 In doing this, we will guide the big wheel on to a
24 sustainable course and onward to starry horizons.

25 Quick story: When I first arrived to Santa

1 Barbara I explored the treasure of the painted cave where
2 I became captivated by the symbols painted by the Chumash
3 visionary. I saw all the black and white sails of a ship,
4 a radiant sun, the cog of a wheel, and web.

5 To me the message was clear: This shaman
6 understood the forces of nature that power the Central
7 Coast.

8 This moment of revelation inspired me to begin
9 designing America's green reconstruction plan along the
10 Central Coast. For our pilot project, we are
11 commissioning the transformation of Platform Holly into
12 the Hutash Lighthouse Maritime Monument, the Beacon of the
13 West. The redesign will significantly reduce seepage,
14 improve public safety, and create a catalyst for
15 aquaculture which filters and oxygenates the water.

16 It will become an iconic attraction for Santa
17 Barbara County and maritime tourism. It is our intention
18 for this to be a gift to the Chumash and pay tribute to
19 those who served on the front lines.

20 This monument and its construction shape the
21 narrative of metamorphosis for our aging oil
22 infrastructure. We seek the tribal council's blessing and
23 California State Lands Commission's approval for the
24 course of action which we outlined in the art and science
25 proposal submitted in August of 2020.

1 Additionally, we are requesting letters of
2 support from community leaders, Governor Gavin Newsom, and
3 those who have services they may contribute to the
4 development of this monumental endeavor.

5 Let's put this star on top of the Holly tree.

6 Thank you, Happy Holidays, and contact us at
7 projectfirstlight.net.

8 Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Ryan.

10 Katie, our next caller?

11 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Chair
12 Yee, at this time, we have no other hands raised for
13 general public comment.

14 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Thank you very much for
15 managing our callers.

16 We will have another opportunity for a public
17 comment for items not on the agenda at the end of our open
18 session today.

19 So let's, members, move on to the next item of
20 business, which is the adoption of the minutes of the
21 Commission's meeting of October 22nd, 2020.

22 Is there a motion to approve the minutes?

23 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: Move approval, Madam
24 Chair.

25 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Thank you, Commissioner

1 Miller.

2 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Second.

3 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Second by Commissioner
4 Kounalakis.

5 Ms. Lucchesi, please call the roll.

6 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Certainly.

7 Commissioner Kounalakis?

8 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Aye.

9 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Commissioner Miller?

10 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: Aye.

11 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Chair Yee?

12 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Aye.

13 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Motion passes
14 unanimously.

15 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you very much.

16 Our next order of business is the Executive
17 Officer's Report.

18 Ms. Lucchesi, may we have the report.

19 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Certainly. I'm
20 happy to provide that report. I will start with providing
21 a brief update of our decommissioning projects.

22 The Commission continues to make progress in
23 abandoning the wells at the former Rincon leases. On the
24 island 46 of the 50 wells have been plugged, and onshore
25 we continue (inaudible) 24 of the 25 wells which have been

1 abandoned.

2 Altogether, we have completed 93 percent of the
3 well abandonments, and Project Completion is expected by
4 June of next year. Total project costs are estimated at
5 38.6 million dollars, which is 4.4 million or 10.2 percent
6 below initial estimates.

7 In September of this year the Commission released
8 a solicitation for an environmental consultant to conduct
9 a feasibility study and prepare CEQA documentation to
10 evaluate decommissioning alternatives for the disposition
11 of the island, the onshore facility, and the causeway.

12 Eight highly qualified firms submitted responses,
13 and we have interviewed four of the most qualified
14 candidates and selected a contractor.

15 This work will begin in first quarter of 2021,
16 and is anticipated to be completed in 2022. This process
17 will include extensive public outreach and stakeholder
18 engagement.

19 Platform Holly plug and abandonment work remains
20 suspended due to COVID-19 restrictions and space
21 limitations on the platform that limit physical distancing
22 practices. Staff continues to maintain and monitor the
23 platform and onshore facilities to ensure public health
24 and safety.

25 ExxonMobil and Commission staff in conjunction

1 with the City of Goleta are developing a project
2 description to decommission the oil piers associated with
3 Lease Number PRC 421 to begin the CEQA process. The
4 Commission will be the CEQA lead agency and applicant for
5 the project. The CEQA process will also include robust
6 stakeholder engagement and is anticipated to take about 12
7 months to complete. Staff and its contractor continue to
8 take unused processing equipment out of service at the
9 Ellwood Processing facility in order to reduce costs.

10 And finally, permission to cross private property
11 to access the State's Ellwood Pier, which is used to
12 transport equipment and personnel to Platform Holly,
13 ceased on December 1st when the access agreement with the
14 surface landowner -- excuse me -- and ExxonMobil expired.

15 The pier, as I mentioned, is used to transport
16 personnel and supplies and to evacuate personnel if there
17 is an emergency at the platform.

18 Both ExxonMobil and Commission operations have
19 relocated to other operating piers in the Santa Barbara
20 channel while negotiations on a new access agreement for
21 Ellwood Pier continue.

22 This SB 44 Legacy Wells and Coastal Hazards
23 program provides \$2 million per year to address legacy
24 wells and coastal hazards. The Commission successfully
25 plugged and abandoned two wells offshore Summerland this

1 past November. Post-abandonment monitoring has shown a
2 visible improvement in beach conditions. Summerland
3 residents and other members of the public have expressed
4 their gratitude to the Commission for our continuing
5 efforts to remediate this decades-old environmental
6 problem. Staff plan to abandon two more wells next year
7 and look forward to continued work with our partner
8 agencies and the community.

9 Also in November the Commission and its
10 contractor removed hazards on behalf of the city of Goleta
11 including 15 pipeline segments that were exposed along the
12 beach because of eroding bluffs.

13 Next I want to move up the coast to the city of
14 Marina. The Cemex coastal sand mining plant facility in
15 Marina has stopped its mining operation. The Cemex
16 facility had operated since the early 1960s and was
17 responsible for some of the highest levels of beach
18 erosion anywhere in California. The mining diminished
19 public trust resources and values such as beach
20 recreation, conservation, and public access.

21 After a coalition of scientists, environmental
22 groups and residents raised significant concerns, the
23 State Lands Commission and the Coastal Commission
24 investigated the operation and reached a settlement, in
25 partnership with the City of Marina, with Cemex in 2017 to

1 cease active sand mining by December 31st of this year.

2 The Commission is pleased that Cemex honored the
3 agreement and ceased operations earlier than expected.
4 Under the settlement the next steps include processing
5 stockpiled sand, initiation of a mine reclamation plan,
6 and conveyance of the property to a nonprofit or
7 governmental entity that commits to managing the property
8 primarily for conservation and access purposes.

9 Next I want to move on to our renewable energy
10 applications for offshore Vandenberg. Staff continues to
11 process two offshore wind applications for the use of tide
12 and submerged lands in the Pacific Ocean off the coast of
13 Vandenberg Air Force Base. Staff is performing a
14 combination of an early public consultation and scoping
15 approach with some project analysis substance of an
16 initial study. This approach will provide preliminary
17 insight on affected resources to help guide early public
18 input on the notice of preparation scoping process for
19 preparation of an EIR.

20 We also hosted our first stakeholder outreach
21 webinar on December 8th. Over 170 individuals attended,
22 representing elected officials, state and federal
23 agencies, tribal representatives, environmental groups,
24 academia, building industry and workforce, fisheries, and
25 ports.

1 A panel of Commission staff provided an overview
2 and background on the Commission's lease application
3 process, differences between federal and state offshore
4 wind projects, and technical details on the two proposed
5 projects. The panel then facilitated an interactive
6 question and answer session with participants. Staff will
7 continue to respond to questions raised during the webinar
8 that were unanswered due to time limitations.

9 The webinar was recorded and will be posted on
10 our website, along with our PowerPoint presentation.
11 Staff will conduct additional smaller and more focused
12 outreach sessions in January and through April of next
13 year.

14 And finally, I want to acknowledge and celebrate
15 a number of retirements that the State Lands Commission is
16 currently facing at the end of this year.

17 It is that time of year where the State
18 experiences a number of retirements, especially from
19 career public servants who have dedicated their lives to
20 serving the people of California.

21 We have been celebrating such public servants at
22 other agencies that we work closely with and who we feel
23 are extended members of our own State Lands family,
24 including Steve Hampton at Fish and Wildlife OSPR, Pat
25 Abel at CalGEM, and Susan Hansch and Jeff Staben at the

1 Coastal Commission.

2 Here at State Lands, we are also celebrating a
3 number of family members and their retirements. First I
4 want to talk about our division chief of our Mineral
5 Resources Management Division, Marina Voskanian. Marina
6 has provided the people of California with nearly 34 years
7 of dedicated and distinguished public service. After
8 receiving her bachelor of science degree in chemical
9 engineering in 1974, Marina earned her master of science
10 degree in petroleum engineering in 1976 and her PhD in
11 petroleum engineering in 1978.

12 She became a registered professional petroleum
13 engineer and spent 12 years in the private sector of the
14 oil and gas industry before entering state service as an
15 engineer with the Commission in 1987.

16 Marina since 1987 has provided expert, technical,
17 and program analysis and recommendations initially as a
18 petroleum reservoir engineer, then as a chief reservoir
19 engineer, and then promoting up to the chief of our
20 planning and development unit, and finally as assistant
21 division chief in the Mineral Resources Management
22 Division in 2009.

23 In 2012, Marina Voskanian served as the first
24 woman to earn the position of Chief of the Mineral
25 Resources Management Division of the Commission. Marina

1 has ably guided the Commission's Mineral Resources
2 Management Division staff and programs with her expertise,
3 professionalism, judgment, empathy, and leadership.

4 Through her effective skills and technical
5 expertise she directed the efficient, safe, and
6 environmentally responsible development of the State's
7 mineral resources. She has guided the Division's
8 transformation and evolution from a focus on hydrocarbon
9 resource development to expanded renewable resource
10 programs including offshore wind.

11 While managing the State's mineral resources,
12 Marina has maintained and provided the highest level of
13 environmental protection and public safety, all while
14 generating over 4 billion to the State's General Fund
15 during her 34 years with the Commission.

16 In addition to being the first female chief of
17 the Mineral Resources Management Division of the
18 Commission, Marina has kept abreast of the advances of the
19 petroleum technology through her long-time participation
20 in the professional society of the Society of Petroleum
21 Engineers. And she served as the first female
22 Los Angeles-based and section chair of the society.

23 She was also the first woman to hold the regional
24 directorship position of the International Society of
25 Petroleum Engineering, representing California and Alaska.

1 And she has received numerous national and international
2 recognition awards.

3 She was also elected distinguished lecturer four
4 times by the Society of Petroleum Engineers and was
5 invited to give lectures in 34 countries promoting the
6 Commission's safety and pollution prevention programs.

7 She succeeded in compiling an impressive record
8 of career achievements, earning her the admiration and
9 respect of her peers, those who have had the privilege of
10 working with her and also of those representing opposing
11 interests.

12 Marina is an incredible leader: Smart,
13 thoughtful, strategic, kind, and dedicated. And I'm so
14 grateful to have been able to learn from her over these
15 past 20 years. And personally I'm internally grateful for
16 her mentorship, patience with my own oil-and-gas-learning
17 curve, and friendship.

18 She will be missed by all of us, and I want to
19 commend and thank her for her distinguished record of
20 professional public service for nearly 34 years serving
21 the Commission.

22 I have a couple more to get through, so be
23 patient with me.

24 Our next retirement celebration-acknowledgement
25 is Denise Cook. Denise Cook has served the Commission

1 since 2001 and the State of California since 1989. And
2 due to her leadership, expertise, and commitment to the
3 Commission, she was appointed chief of the Commission's
4 Administrative Services Division in 2018. So, here we --
5 and she was also the first female to be appointed chief to
6 this division as well.

7 And so just as a -- as a note, I think it's
8 really incredible that we're celebrating these two pioneer
9 women in their own fields with the Commission that is also
10 (inaudible) its membership of all females as well.

11 Through Denise's empathetic positive
12 reinforcement and quite confidence leadership style,
13 Denise maintained the highest level of fiscal integrity
14 for the Commission.

15 And through her determined involvement and
16 persistent advocacy, she has been instrumental in
17 implementing the state's extremely complex fiscal program
18 at the Commission.

19 And Denise during the height of the COVID
20 pandemic volunteered her leadership skills to direct a
21 group of contact tracers in this invaluable effort, which
22 really speaks to her kindness, dedication of public
23 service, and willingness to help her fellow Californians.

24 Denise has succeeded in compiling an impressive
25 record of career achievements as well, earning her also

1 the admiration and respect of all of who have had the
2 privilege of working with her.

3 Next I want to knowledge and celebrate Greg
4 Pelka. Greg was initially hired with the State and the
5 Commission in 1982 as an energy and mineral resources
6 engineer. He was promoted to a senior mineral resources
7 engineer in 1997, and has served the Commission over 38
8 years.

9 Greg is an incredibly kind, smart, thoughtful,
10 and very dedicated public servant to the Commission. He
11 has really led the effort in building our abandoned mines
12 program, in coordination and partnership with the
13 Department of Conservation. His work over the many
14 decades on our abandoned mines program has literally saved
15 lives.

16 I will never forget one of the times that I was
17 able to accompany Greg on a trip to look at some of the
18 mines -- abandoned mines that he was looking to remediate,
19 and really get a handle on the work that he does every
20 day.

21 We stayed at Buffalo Bill's in Primm, Nevada, and
22 traipsed around the hillsides and the mountains of San
23 Bernardino County for a couple of days.

24 Greg is just one of those salt-of-the-earth,
25 genuine, patient people; and the people of California are

1 just so lucky that he worked over 38 years to really make
2 the lands that the Commission has jurisdiction over safer
3 for all of those adventurists and outdoor enthusiasts to
4 traipse around and explore California's desert.

5 I want to commend and thank Greg for his
6 distinguished record of professional public service
7 serving the Commission over the past 38 years.

8 And finally, I want to acknowledge and celebrate
9 Barry Schuffels. After joining the Commission in December
10 of 2006 Barry has spent the following 14 years as a valued
11 member of our Southern California Field Office field
12 inspection staff. Barry has been able to utilize a lot of
13 maritime experience and ensuring full and insightful
14 inspections, having worked for 23 years at Crowley
15 Maritime before coming to the Commission.

16 Barry has always been conscientious about all of
17 his duties at State Lands, ensuring he was always positive
18 in his approach to our work, and a joy to work with for
19 both the regulated community as well as his colleagues at
20 the Commission.

21 And I also want to just identi -- say a note
22 about the work of our inspectors.

23 From the beginning of the pandemic, the oil and
24 gas industry, from production and development to
25 transportation, was considered an essential service.

1 And our inspectors did not miss a beat in terms
2 of inspecting and monitoring transfers of petroleum
3 products or our marine oil terminals or inspecting and
4 monitoring the offshore facilities.

5 And they can -- even with the concerns around the
6 transmission of COVID are dedicated to ensuring the
7 public's health and safety and protection of the marine
8 environment during the past eight months.

9 So retirements like Marina's, Denise's, Greg's,
10 and Barry's are always so bittersweet. We are sad to know
11 that we won't be able to work with our incredible
12 colleagues every day on important Commission projects, but
13 we are extremely happy and excited for them to embark on
14 this new phase of their life and know they will enjoy
15 their well deserved retirement and make the most of the
16 next adventure in their life.

17 We'll be saying goodbye to valuable and dedicated
18 employees and we'll miss them greatly. And I speak for
19 all of Commission's staff in wishing Marina, Denise, Greg,
20 and Barry the best in their future adventures, and thank
21 them for their outstanding work and dedication to the
22 Commission and the people of California.

23 And if it is okay with the Chair, I would love to
24 turn it over to Marina Voskanian just to say a couple of
25 words.

1 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Absolutely.

2 Thank you, Jennifer, for the report.

3 Good morning, Marina.

4 MINERAL RESOURCES MANAGEMENT DIVISION CHIEF

5 VOSKANIAN: Good morning, Madam Chair.

6 Thank you for the recognition and your kind
7 words, Jennifer. And all the commissioners, I'm proud and
8 honored to have served the State Lands Commission
9 governance and State leadership provided by you and the
10 past commissioners during my career.

11 I'm grateful that I have worked under the
12 leadership and professionalism of our Executive Officer
13 Jennifer Lucchesi. Fortunately (inaudible), we have
14 leaders that work hard to protect the State's resources
15 and environment and I'm grateful I have been a part of
16 that legacy.

17 I will cherish the memories and friendship I made
18 over the years with the Commission and wish you continued
19 success with all your important programs.

20 Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Marina, and all best
22 wishes to you; and thank you so much for your service to
23 the Commission and to the people of California.

24 Thank you, Ms. Lucchesi, for the report.

25 Let me turn to Commissioners Kounalakis and

1 Miller to see if there are any comments or questions.

2 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Thank you very much,
3 Madam Chair.

4 It's always very inspiring to have these
5 recognitions of people who have worked in service to the
6 State for most, if not all, of their career.

7 And that as they close this chapter and go on to
8 whatever it is that awaits them in their retirement, we
9 take a pause and recognize how important public service
10 is, how important things that the public may have
11 forgotten or may never even have known about the
12 incredibly hard work that all of our staff here puts in
13 every day.

14 And, Marina, as you were talking I was -- I
15 couldn't help but think of how many lieutenant governors
16 you've seen come through the State Lands Commission over
17 the years. And through it all, you and Denise, Barry and
18 Greg, you have given it your all and dedicated your lives
19 in service to the State of California. And, Marina,
20 looking behind you at the that beautiful image of our
21 coast, you know, it's clear what your mission has been.
22 And, of course, you're not the only one to have that
23 picture behind you of course it's State land. But it
24 really says it all.

25 And so for your tireless work -- you know, I'm

1 sorry that we're not all together so we could share a
2 couple of cupcakes, maybe a glass of bubbly. Jennifer, I
3 don't know. But at least virtually in this setting to be
4 able to take this moment to recognize you, to thank you,
5 and to really attempt in this, you know, moment to
6 understand and help the public understand how incredibly
7 important your work is; again even to think that they may
8 never know who's behind it. But when they go to a beach
9 or they go to our coastline, or in the multitude of other
10 ways that the State Lands protects our beautiful
11 environment or beautiful coast, that there are people
12 every day toiling away to do the hard work.

13 So thank you all, and I hope that your next
14 chapter is full of some great hikes and the ability to
15 experience the incredible environment that you have helped
16 to steward during your career.

17 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Commissioner
18 Kounalakis. Really wonderful words.

19 Commissioner Miller, comment?

20 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
21 Chair.

22 Just also sharing my -- all my very best and
23 gratitude for your service. It's really an inspiration to
24 see a career of such incredible public service, and one
25 with such humility and grace.

1 So thank you very much.

2 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Commissioner Miller.

3 And let me add my congratulations to Marina, to
4 Denise and Greg, and to Barry as well. I think the word
5 that Commissioner Miller just used that it always stay
6 with me of all of the Commission staff is humility. You
7 know, we do this work under sometimes some very
8 extraordinary circumstances. But it is about just really
9 making a contribution. And I hope you all feel just very
10 rewarded by the fact that you're leaving very lasting
11 legacies with the work that you've done for the people of
12 California. And we're so, so appreciative. Thank you.

13 And to Marina, thank you. You've been a mentor
14 of mine from afar. So really appreciate all of your work.

15 Ms. Lucchesi, I have to just say, you know,
16 obviously this all happens with leadership from the top in
17 terms of the culture that you've been able to instill in
18 this organization, and I think that certainly comes
19 through with respect to the work that gets accomplished.
20 And I just wanted to just add my thanks for the -- the
21 plugging of the abandoned wells and just the tremendous
22 work that's gone into that and the wonderful progress that
23 we're making to have that initiative come in under cost.
24 And to have the kind of progress that we're seeing is just
25 really nothing short of remarkable, particularly during

1 this time when that work needs to continue under some
2 limitations.

3 And then, very, very proud of the actions that
4 this Commission took in partnership with our sister
5 agencies relative to the ceasing of sand mining by Cemex.
6 It was a -- this was really a historic moment and
7 certainly for our communities in the Monterey Central
8 Coast. This has been a long time coming. So thank you
9 for the sustained attention to this and really I think
10 calls for celebration.

11 Thank you very much.

12 Okay. Let's -- we'll now move on to our next
13 order of business, which will be the adoption of the
14 Consent Calendar.

15 Commissioners Kounalakis or Miller, any items
16 that you would like removed from the consent calendar?

17 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: No.

18 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: (Shakes head.)

19 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Next, let me call on
20 Ms. Lucchesi to indicate which items if any have been
21 removed from the consent calendar.

22 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Certainly.

23 Consent items 16, 23, and 50 are removed from the
24 agenda and will be considered at a later time.

25 And that concludes the removal of any items from

1 the agenda.

2 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Great. Thank you.

3 Let me just now turn to see if there's anyone
4 joining us virtually who wishes to speak on any item
5 remaining on the consent calendar. Items 16, 23, and 50
6 have been removed, to be considered for a later time. If
7 we do have anyone who wishes to speak on the remaining
8 items, please raise your Zoom hand and -- or dial 9 if
9 joining by phone now.

10 And, Katie, let me just look to you to see if
11 there are any speakers.

12 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Chair
13 Yee, we have Patricia McPherson who would like to speak.

14 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you.

15 Good morning, Patricia.

16 MS. MCPHERSON: Good morning. My name is
17 Patricia McPherson. I'm President of Grassroots
18 Coalition.

19 And, State Lands Commission, I was glad to hear
20 about the abandoned well information. And I would just
21 like to remind everyone that there is -- State Lands
22 Commission has property located in Ballona Wetlands
23 Ecological Reserve that has a well that is currently
24 leaking known as University City Syndicate. And I would
25 just like to draw your attention to -- to this area that

1 is Public Trust land but is steward by the State Lands
2 Commission, which is also known as the fresh water marsh
3 in Ballona Wetlands.

4 And I just wanted to draw that to your attention.
5 Grassroots Coalition has been working with the State Water
6 Board. We've brought in experts that were the former city
7 of LA experts for oil and gas issues, that have raised a
8 red flag regarding this well and the dangers it poses.
9 And we'd just like to have assistance from State Lands
10 Commission in addressing this issue.

11 Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Patricia.

13 Katie, let me just see if there are any other
14 speakers for items that are remaining on the consent
15 agenda.

16 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Thank
17 you, Chair Yee.

18 We have our next speaker -- oop, they've lowered
19 their hand.

20 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Any other speakers?

21 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Chair,
22 Yee, at this time, we have no other hands raised.

23 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Katie.

24 All right. Seeing no other hands raised, we will
25 now proceed with the vote.

1 May I have a motion to adopt the consent agenda
2 and a second.

3 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: So moved.

4 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Moved by Commissioner
5 Kounalakis.

6 I will second that motion.

7 And, Ms. Lucchesi, please call the roll.

8 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Certainly.

9 Commissioner Kounalakis?

10 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Aye.

11 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Commissioner Miller?
12 Chair Yee?

13 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Aye.

14 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: The motion passes.

15 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Oh, here comes Commissioner
16 Miller.

17 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: Oh, I'm so sorry. I
18 stepped away.

19 CHAIRPERSON YEE: That's all right.

20 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: I vote aye.

21 Thank you. My apologies. I'm sorry.

22 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Great.

23 CHAIRPERSON YEE: No problem.

24 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: The motion passes
25 unanimously.

1 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you very much.

2 All right. Let's move on to the next order of
3 business, which will be the regular calendar.

4 Item 60 is an informational update on efforts to
5 develop the Commission's 2021 to 2025 Strategic Plan.

6 May we have the presentation.

7 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Yes. Katie
8 Robinson-Filipp from our staff will be introducing this
9 item, followed by Lisa Beutler with Stantec.

10 And her pre -- Katie's presentation or their
11 collective presentation should be being loaded now.

12 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay.

13 (Thereupon a slide presentation.)

14 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Thank
15 you Madam Chair and commissioners. My name is Katie
16 Robinson-Filipp and I am an environmental scientist at the
17 Commission.

18 This year the Commission has worked with the
19 consultant, Stantec, to develop an aspirational and
20 forward-looking 2021-2025 Strategic Plan. Together,
21 Commission staff and Stantec have coordinated a
22 comprehensive and inclusive engagement outreach effort to
23 inform the development of the draft plan, including an
24 extensive series of stakeholder interviews, representing
25 various areas of interest, and a series of tribal

1 engagement roundtable sessions and individual
2 consultations.

3 Additionally, the consultant has facilitated a
4 workshop with senior Commission management to solicit
5 their input on the trends, issues, and priorities that
6 will affect the Commission's work over the next five to 10
7 years.

8 Commission staff have worked with a consultant to
9 incorporate the input and feedback from these engagement
10 efforts into an initial draft of the 2021-2025 Strategic
11 Plan, which is now available for public review.

12 The development of the Strategic Plan is an
13 iterative process, and staff looks forward to receiving
14 feedback and additional perspectives, ideas, and comments
15 on the current draft Strategic Plan.

16 Today, Lisa Beutler from Stantec will present an
17 overview of the structure and content for the 2021-2025
18 draft Strategic Plan, followed by an update from the
19 Executive Officer Jennifer Lucchesi on next steps before
20 opening for comments and questions.

21 And now I'd like welcome Lisa to provide her
22 presentation, please.

23 Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Katie.

25 MS. BEUTLER: Thank you.

1 Okay. We'll go to the next slide, please.

2 --o0o--

3 MS. BEUTLER: My name's Lisa Beutler, and I was
4 very honored to lead the consultant team for this
5 document.

6 As a reminder, we've pulled together quite a few
7 people that represented a lot of different interests in
8 preparing this plan. As Katie mentioned, we talked with
9 senior staff.

10 Another thing that we did was go back and look at
11 your Commission meeting notes and we reviewed speeches
12 that many of you made. And you are wonderful speakers,
13 that have spoken in a number of formats. We went back and
14 took a look at that. Our goal was to prepare a plan that
15 would be very faithful to what we heard and would
16 represent what we thought was the overall ethic that -- of
17 the Commission itself.

18 So moving to the next slide.

19 --o0o--

20 MS. BEUTLER: This is how the plan is actually
21 structured. We prepared an executive highlights. This
22 was the smaller document that would be easy to pull out.
23 We're very appreciative of the fact that that may be the
24 only thing that anybody actually reads because of the size
25 of the plan. So our goal here was to synthesize what was

1 there and make it easy to read, and we would really be
2 looking for comments about that but to help us make sure
3 we hit all the right points as well as that we were able
4 to properly synthesize and make it accessible in terms of
5 reading.

6 The plan then breaks a little bit into a
7 traditional strategic plan structure, which talks about
8 who you are, where you've been, the drivers of change,
9 what you're called to do, and the strategic focus areas
10 and goals.

11 We would offer that there may be some that would
12 be hoping for very specific items to be included in this
13 plan. And that's really not the intention of this plan.
14 The goal of this plan is to set forward a direction and
15 drive to the future. We believe it's going to be
16 important for the Commission to spend time with -- very
17 deliberative time with some of the things that were asked
18 to be included that wasn't really the role of the
19 Strategic Plan to do that.

20 We also heard from staff that were looking
21 forward to doing some specific things. And what the
22 strategic focus areas do and what staff will be -- the
23 senior leadership of the organization will be doing is
24 coming back to you with work plans and different kinds of
25 goals each year to talk about how you're going to move

1 forward to make progress in the strategic focused areas.

2 So I've now covered very quickly the various
3 parts of the plan.

4 Next slide, please.

5 --o0o--

6 MS. BEUTLER: So first part is the "who we are."
7 It talks about what the Commission's responsibilities are,
8 the vision, values, and guiding principles.

9 And to the next slide.

10 --o0o--

11 MS. BEUTLER: So in understanding what the
12 Commission's values are, the -- this is basically a
13 statement of your culture, of who you are, what you
14 represent. And so people know when they're interacting
15 with the Commission, these are the kinds of things that
16 they can expect, this is the way that the Commission
17 intends to be present in the world.

18 --o0o--

19 MS. BEUTLER: The next slide talks about the
20 principles. The guiding principles are the ways that you
21 make decisions, the way you shape the culture. It's
22 essentially a form of a report card. So for every
23 decision that comes in front of the Commission, there is
24 an understanding that we've evaluated the health and
25 safety, that we've looked at stewardship, that there is

1 accountability, that there's integrity, there's been
2 engagement, people have been incorporated, they're quality
3 and very solution oriented. So it's a way of doing
4 things.

5 --o0o--

6 MS. BEUTLER: The next slide talks about what we
7 heard from people that we talked to.

8 So here we heard about climate change and
9 sea-level rise. We heard a lot about environmental,
10 economic, and social injustice and the need to address
11 that. Some really wonderful comments that came forward
12 from the government-to-government consultations and
13 conversations that staff held with tribal governments
14 about self-governance and self-determination.

15 A lot of heartfelt discussion about the Public
16 Trust principles. And really in-depth thinking about what
17 happens in a post-petroleum era.

18 So the drivers of change are described and
19 summarized in the plan to see how people understand what
20 it is that you're -- that it's really pushing you towards
21 the future.

22 --o0o--

23 MS. BEUTLER: So the next item in the plan is the
24 call to action. So based on what we heard, we were able
25 to capture what it is that you've been asked to do. And

1 clearly there's never been a time where the path forward
2 has been more challenging. There's a need to address
3 climate change. There's the need to take a look at social
4 and environmental justice, looking at ways to navigate the
5 economy especially adjusting to our pandemic, and the
6 unyielding need for stewardship and conservation of the
7 public lands. So you've decided you've been called
8 forward to take a look and take a path that will achieve
9 the right endpoint.

10 The next space, the next slide.

11 --o0o--

12 MS. BEUTLER: We also heard that you've been
13 called to action in a time where swift change is required.
14 The demands for communication elevation and responding to
15 every level experience are forward for you. You know you
16 can make changes. You know you can protect the
17 environment and grow the economy. These are not mutually
18 exclusive. These are things that can be done as -- and
19 both.

20 You know that you can uplift and empower
21 communities and provide more equitable realities and
22 brighter futures for everyone.

23 Something that was exciting to us since we talk
24 to people, there is a collective vocabulary that has
25 grown. We are now talking collectively about

1 inclusively -- inclusivity, about equitably -- diversity,
2 accessibility, sustainability, collaboration, and
3 innovation.

4 This was the next slide.

5 --o0o--

6 MS. BEUTLER: So the next thing that the document
7 does is that -- here's what you're called to do, and
8 here's how you can put it together. These are
9 cross-cutting issues. There are a lot of things that you
10 can do that one part will help inform another part. So
11 this is how do we put it together. And seven specific
12 ideas will pull together about how to do that. I'll
13 discuss them in order.

14 So moving to the next slide.

15 --o0o--

16 MS. BEUTLER: So the first one is: Leading
17 climate activism. The climate changes is clearly
18 threatening people. The highlights are that this plan
19 really puts forth ideas about proactively addressing
20 climate change by leveraging lands under its jurisdiction,
21 and partnering, collaborating and engaging with the sister
22 agencies.

23 Some of the features of this particular section
24 of the document is about justly transitioning activities,
25 that there is a need to move out of the petroleum-based

1 activities' carbon emissions. There are ways to move to
2 carbon neutral, and renewable energy options actually
3 contribute positively to new ways of revenue and energy
4 generation.

5 Also, an ability for you to do carbon
6 sequestration and actually look at emission reductions
7 strategies.

8 The part about partnering talks about the need
9 for unified and coordinated action and policies across all
10 of the State's agencies. And this is a leadership role
11 that we heard was very important from the other agencies,
12 that they felt that the Commission could really take a big
13 role here.

14 We also heard and we believe that there's an
15 interest on that they have the Commission considering
16 options for climate refugees. I think we even heard a
17 speaker earlier during the public comment of people who
18 are experiencing consequences from climate change that are
19 quite dramatic.

20 We have a need for climate resilient green
21 infrastructure, and there are lots of ways to do
22 co-management which are very exciting.

23 --o0o--

24 MS. BEUTLER: The next item talks about social
25 and economic and environmental justice.

1 And for here, what we wanted to highlight was the
2 way to proactively incorporate correction of historic
3 actions. So this was not just a go-forward but a look
4 back as well, if there is inequity, that it's based on
5 past practices. And there may be a way for the Commission
6 to really get in front of that and talk about a different
7 way of doing things that can bring some form of equity to
8 what's happened in the past.

9 The center point of this particular activity is
10 inclusion; that there's a need to bring people in and have
11 them be part of the process of thinking about what should
12 happen. So rather than things being done on behalf of or
13 for or to people, that they are co-creating like that
14 outcome might be.

15 We also know that there are ways that you can do
16 decision making that will lower CalEnviroScreen scores so
17 that they have less impact on communities. And that
18 there's a great opportunity for rethinking the way the
19 lands are managed to create more ownership for the
20 communities in which they occur.

21 --o0o--

22 MS. BEUTLER: The next item talks about
23 partnering with tribal governments and communities. The
24 foundation of this particular area of the plan is respect.
25 There is a rich understanding on the behalf of the

1 Commission about the traditional ecological knowledge, and
2 the kind of information and thoughtfulness, that the
3 tribal peoples are able to bring to decision making and
4 the great relationship of the land and the Commission that
5 can be evolved through the relationship with the tribes.

6 --o0o--

7 MS. BEUTLER: The next item has to do with
8 meeting evolving Public Trust needs. This may be a little
9 bit surprising the way that we have addressed this or
10 approached this. It's really grounded in the idea of
11 communication outreach and co-creation. So rather than
12 laying out specific types of things that the trust should
13 do, one of the things we heard from the public when we
14 talked to them about this is people don't really
15 understand the trust and they don't really understand the
16 rich heritage that the trust brings; and so they're not
17 operating in the way that is enhancing to the trust.

18 So this section really focuses on ways of
19 organizing and interacting with others, to really extend
20 that.

21 Another thing that we heard was really important
22 to people was creating new kinds of partnerships with
23 institutions and organizations to extend what's possible
24 to do with the trust and the trust lands.

25 --o0o--

1 MS. BEUTLER: So the next one after that is all
2 about leveraging technology. And there are lots of
3 traditional things that we always hear about, you know,
4 getting our data systems in place. There's real interest
5 though in improving the decision support; a very
6 heightened understanding of the kinds of needs to improve
7 security and risk management. Our technology can
8 certainly bring us sufficiency.

9 One of the things though that really jumped out
10 particularly in this time of the pandemic is how
11 technology can change the way that we interact with
12 others; that we're going now be allowed to be in different
13 kinds of meetings. We had a speaker already mention this,
14 how much they appreciate the fact that they could attend
15 this meeting when maybe in the past they couldn't have.

16 It's also changed the way that staff can interact
17 with others throughout the organization. So a lot of
18 focus to that, and a real focus to enhancing the decision
19 support and data functions of the Commission.

20 The next one is commitment to collaborative
21 leadership. This is what we heard over and over again -
22 and we've mentioned this to you previously - about the
23 great desire of the other agencies to look to you to
24 provide leadership that pulls together all of the other
25 agencies, that you have this amazing ability to serve as

1 the convener and mediator of planning and policy
2 dialogues. That you're able to bring in
3 multi-disciplinary approaches and that you're able to help
4 set the stage and on a much bigger -- greater basis than
5 any other agency's really able to do. So it's a call to
6 you -- a request, a call for action from the others for
7 you to be able to take this role.

8 So also we heard that there's just a real need to
9 continue and model what you've done so well, stakeholder
10 and public engagement; that you have been able to
11 institutionalize this relationship. And something that's
12 been important to you and you've been able to do quite
13 well is move this beyond just an individual relationship
14 with one person on a staff or somebody that somebody
15 knows, but broadly across the entire Commission, that
16 that's -- that everyone understands the Commission itself
17 that is advocating for this relationship and engagement.

18 --o0o--

19 MS. BEUTLER: And then finally, the last item is
20 building a reimagined workforce. We've already heard that
21 there are people retiring. One of the -- we heard
22 wonderful things about the Lands Commission staff, and it
23 was just across the board. The only time we ever heard
24 anything that was even remotely negative had to do with
25 people not -- about the Commission being asked to do

1 something that it wasn't really organized to do. So there
2 were certain kinds of decision sets or spans of control
3 that the Commission has, and sometimes people couldn't
4 quite figure out how to interface because there wasn't a
5 program or something in the Commission that did it. It
6 always got resolved.

7 I see Jennifer actually nodding her head.

8 It gets resolved, because, you know, Jennifer,
9 and Colin, and everybody put their head together and
10 figured out how are we going to do this, where does this
11 go?

12 So one of the things that the executive team has
13 been looking is kind of reimagining how they might be
14 structured to better do that, to get those workstreams
15 that are more reflective of the new work -- the new work
16 that you know is going to be coming to you and also take a
17 look at succession management. I mean, I don't know how
18 you replace some of the people that we heard about today,
19 they're so amazing. And you must, and you must.

20 So, this is a little bit about how the team is
21 going to be doing that.

22 Something that was really -- that people were
23 passionate about and we were excited about when we met
24 with the senior team was this idea that -- that solutions
25 and responses should not be siloed. People wanted

1 multi-disciplinary approaches. Even counsel, the legal
2 team was hopping. And there's ways that everyone can work
3 together to make sure that things were done and improve
4 efficiency. So people actually really helping each other
5 rather than having things happen in silos.

6 And the last one is kind of an interesting one,
7 but everyone was really committed to removing or
8 eliminating bottlenecks. So with that, I have done a very
9 fast tour of a relatively long document. Once again, I do
10 appreciate there were people that had really hoped to see
11 very specific items included in the plan, and they're not
12 there. I hope that our reasoning is understandable. I do
13 believe that we heard a lot of good ideas and they deserve
14 deliberation. They just don't have a specific action item
15 in this plan.

16 And I'll turn this to the Executive Officer.

17 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Thank you. Thank
18 you, Lisa. And thank you to your entire team for the
19 presentation and the hard work on developing this draft
20 Strategic Plan.

21 Our staff has worked with Stantec to incorporate
22 the input ideas and comments from the stakeholder and
23 tribal engagement and public meetings and comments over
24 the past eight months into this draft plan presented
25 today.

1 This is a working draft. And we are committed to
2 being responsive to the input and comments from the
3 continuing engagement process.

4 I really look at this as -- Stantec and our team
5 did a tremendous amount of work to engage our
6 stakeholders, engage our partners, and our staff. Now,
7 we're at ground truthing, the ground truthing stage, where
8 we have a draft document and people have something to
9 react to, and we can continue this really robust and rich
10 conversation about where we might have gotten it right and
11 where we got it wrong, and how we are going forward.

12 So again, I don't want anybody listening or
13 watching this to think that we're at the end of the
14 process. We are right smack in the middle of it where we
15 should be and really understanding and gaining a deeper
16 understanding of input and perspective and trying to
17 understand where all of our stakeholders are coming from.

18 So we really encourage everyone to continue to
19 share their voice, their insight and experience, as we
20 work to refine this plan. And obviously on the screen,
21 you can see how folks -- or maybe the screen is done now.

22 So, you can provide suggestions, by phone, or by
23 email. All of that information is on our website. And we
24 are happy to answer any questions the commissioners may
25 have at this point, or even after some of the public

1 comment is shared.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Ms. Lucchesi. Thank
4 you, Lisa and to Katie and to the team for really taking
5 all of the input and developing this framework, which is
6 as Ms. Lucchesi has pointed out we're kind of midway in
7 our process and definitely still want to hear from
8 everyone.

9 Let me turn to Commissioners Kounalakis and
10 Miller to see if there are any questions or comments at
11 this time.

12 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Thank you, Madam Chair.
13 And just really briefly. This has been a very important
14 ongoing effort. And it looks as though we're going to be
15 continuing with it into the new year. So, Madam Chair,
16 thank you for your origination of the strategic plan, your
17 stewardship over the last year.

18 And I think it's important to underscore, as
19 Ms. Lucchesi noted, that we're going to continue to take
20 input. And we have more work to do into 2021.

21 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you. Thank you very
22 much, Commissioner Kounalakis.

23 Commissioner Miller, any comment?

24 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: (Shakes head.)

25 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Thank you.

1 Let's -- first let me just say, really wonderful,
2 wonderful document. And again, I know we've been hearing
3 from some of the stakeholders about specific issues. And
4 I just want to also reiterate that these issues are not
5 being ignored. I think this framework actually is very
6 accommodating in terms of just some of the more specific
7 things that are being raised; and so now know what is
8 being brought before this Commission will be ignored by
9 any means.

10 And I just appreciate the proactiveness and the
11 just necessarily future orientation of a document,
12 understanding that things around us are evolving. And
13 particularly first and foremost our charge of being really
14 the stewards of the Public Trust. And how there are going
15 to be many, many more demands and certainly areas of focus
16 that we are going to be tasked with having to consider.
17 And so to just recognize that up front as part of our
18 framework, and just really appreciative of.

19 So let me turn to Katie and see if we have any
20 public comments on this item. And if anyone wishes to
21 comment, please raise your Zoom hand now.

22 And, Katie, I'm going to help -- I know there are
23 speakers for this item, so if you'll just start calling
24 them one at a time.

25 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Thank

1 you, Chair Yee.

2 The first person making comment on this item is
3 Jason Giffen.

4 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you.

5 Good morning, Jason.

6 MR. GIFFEN: Thank you very much. Good morning,
7 Chair Yee, commissioners, Executive Officer Lucchesi, and
8 staff. My name is Jason Giffen, and I'm a vice president
9 for the Port of San Diego. Thank you very much for the
10 opportunity to provide public comment on this important
11 item.

12 As a grantee of State lands, a self-sustaining
13 public benefit corporation and regional government entity,
14 the Port is appreciative of the statewide coordination the
15 Commission and your staff have implemented as you look to
16 update your Strategic Plan. Both our CEO Randa Coniglio
17 and Job Nelson, our Chief Policy Officer, have been
18 directly involved and contributed to the process so far.
19 We are grateful for your genuine interest in supporting
20 ports and harbors as well as the communities and
21 stakeholders we serve.

22 Specifically, I'd like to also thank Chair Yee
23 and Ms. Lucchesi for your recent visit to the Port of San
24 Diego where you were able to see firsthand how our port
25 operations and projects are continuing to provide public

1 benefits despite our long list of current challenges.

2 We view the State Lands Commission as one of our
3 most valuable partners, and strategic alignment is the X
4 factor in our shared success. We have developed
5 productive working relationships over the years that have
6 contributed to our shared success, whether it be through
7 projects like the San Diego Ocean Planning Partnership
8 by -- led by Chair Yee's vision or supporting innovations
9 like the Port's Blue Economy Incubator, proving to be just
10 one catalyst that's helping drive our blue economy through
11 public-private partnerships that support projects and
12 investments to restore our environment, support emerging
13 marine technology and infrastructure solutions, or
14 otherwise contribute to improve public benefits in and
15 around our tidelands and submerged lands.

16 We were happy to participate in the outreach in
17 your first Strategic Plan, and now it will be a part of
18 the development of this second iteration.

19 As chronicled in your staff report, we too are
20 seeing demand for our responsibilities and missions
21 broadening, whether it be related to climate change or
22 coastal resilience, financial sustainability, equity and
23 environmental justice, or the evolution of public benefits
24 under the Public Trust, we are witnessing similar trends
25 to the ones you were discovering through the strategic

1 planning process. And we appreciate your support as we
2 collectively strive to tackle complex issues and balance
3 our Public Trust responsibilities together.

4 We look forward to continuing our partnership
5 with the Commission and your staff and to facilitate and
6 promote responsible maritime commerce; navigation, trade,
7 and waterfront revitalization; while also supporting
8 recreation and environmental stewardship.

9 We thank you for today's update led by Executive
10 Officer Lucchesi and her staff, and we will be sure to
11 provide you with some thoughtful written comments on the
12 draft document in the coming weeks.

13 Thank you very much. And that concludes my
14 remarks.

15 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Jason, very much for
16 your comments.

17 Katie, our next speaker?

18 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Yes.
19 Our next speaker is Jeff Boehm.

20 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Jeff.

21 DR. BOEHM: Good morning, Chair Yee,
22 commissioners, and Executive Officer Lucchesi. Thank you
23 for the opportunity to provide comments before the
24 Commission this morning.

25 My name is Dr. Jeff Boehm and I am the chief

1 executive officer at the Marine Mammal Center. I want to
2 thank the Commission for addressing seabed mining and this
3 draft Strategic Plan is a strong first step towards
4 developing real and meaningful policies and regulations on
5 this issue. This offers promise for precautionary actions
6 that will safeguard marine mammals, other marine wildlife,
7 and the ocean ecosystem.

8 I'm trained as a veterinarian and I've served as
9 the CEO of the Marine Mammal Center now since 2008. The
10 Marine Mammal Center is the world's largest marine mammal
11 teaching hospital, treating hundreds of marine mammal
12 patients each year and, as such, is an ocean conservation
13 organization with a global impact. We train as many as
14 100 future marine mammal veterinarians and biologists each
15 year, and have cared for more than 24,000 marine mammal
16 patients during our 45-year history. We learn from every
17 patient that's in our care about their health, the health
18 of their species, and their ocean home, and about the
19 connection to human health.

20 We are on the front lines of ocean change and are
21 witness to the many stressors that marine mammals face
22 along the California coast. Our patients present
23 malnourished from inadequate or displaced food sources,
24 suffering from infections and toxins, entangled in fishing
25 lines and marine debris, and dying from cancer at a rate

1 that is extraordinary among wildlife species.

2 In 2014, in a statement of evidence on the
3 application of a firm seeking rights to mine seabeds in
4 the coastal waters of New Zealand, an Otago University
5 associate professor shared the following:

6 "The potential impacts of the proposed mining on
7 marine mammals include: collisions with vessels and mining
8 equipment; habitat degradation; noise; and pollution,
9 including increased availability of toxins in the seabed
10 due to the mining activity. The potential ecological
11 effects include impacts of the proposed mining on benthic
12 organisms, which affect higher trophic levels including
13 fish densities and/or movements, which in turn may affect
14 prey availability for marine mammals. These impacts are
15 predicted to occur within the mining area itself as well
16 as in the downstream sediment plume area."

17 Our marine mammals in California don't need these
18 additional threats. Our collective actions should be
19 focused on securing a healthy ocean habitat for these
20 species and the myriad other species that live in coastal
21 waters of California and rely on their health. An
22 enormous tourism and fishery economy depend on the same.

23 An oft-cited pledge among medical professionals
24 is to first do no harm. The California State Lands
25 Commission ought to be guided by the same counsel as it

1 refines its Strategic Plan. In consideration of seabed
2 mining, I urge the Commission to continue with the steps
3 that had begun to develop a strong policy framework,
4 potentially leading to a prohibition of seabed mining.

5 Thank you for your time this morning.

6 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Jeff, very much for
7 your comments.

8 Katie, our next speaker?

9 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: The
10 next speaker is Courtney Vail.

11 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Courtney.

12 MS. VAIL: Good morning.

13 Good morning, esteemed commissioners. I am
14 Courtney Vail, Campaign Director, Oceanic Preservation
15 Society based in Greenbrae in Marin County.

16 I thank you for this additional opportunity to
17 address the Commission on the topic of seabed mining off
18 the coastline of California. I have seen the Commission's
19 draft Strategic Plan for 2021 to 2025 that was released
20 for public comment, and we are encouraged that the
21 Commission has recognized the importance and potential
22 threat that seabed mining poses to California's marine
23 ecosystems. By expressing an interest in commencing a
24 collaborative stakeholder dialogue to explore this issue
25 within the context of other extractive industry, and while

1 considering the development and encouragement of renewable
2 energy sources, the Commission has signaled its proactive
3 leadership on this topic.

4 We support the Commission's intentions to consult
5 with other agencies, to explore this issue and possible
6 solutions, and recognize the need for diverse inclusive
7 stakeholder representation when formulating next steps of
8 action.

9 We also appreciate that the Commission takes the
10 Public Trust Doctrine to heart, vowing to steward and
11 protect the public's right to use California's waterways
12 including for natural habitat protection and to reflect
13 the values of an evolving society.

14 This means keeping a check on the privatization
15 of our coastal ecosystem that are critical for climate
16 resilience as well as planetary and human health; and that
17 can be undermined by extractive industries.

18 In closing, we want to reiterate our gratitude
19 for the Commission's intentions to move forward with
20 exploring policy options to address this issue, and affirm
21 our position that seabed mining does not belong in
22 California's coastal waters. The Strategic Plan sites the
23 dire predictions outlined within California's fourth
24 climate change assessment report of 2018. And within this
25 context, I can't imagine the Commission not taking action

1 to proactively address and prevent activities that
2 threaten coastal resilience or coastal restoration in the
3 face of climate chaos. Now is the time to preempt,
4 mitigate, and restore our natural heritage, not leave it
5 vulnerable to exploitation.

6 Thank you for taking steps in the right
7 direction. We pledge our support as you continue your
8 review of this important issue, and will provide more
9 detailed comments before the January 31st deadline.

10 Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Courtney.
12 Katie, our next speaker?

13 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Our
14 next speaker is Casey Cruikshank.

15 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Casey.

16 MS. CRUIKSHANK: Good morning, commissioners and
17 staff. My name is Casey Cruikshank from the Northcoast
18 Environmental Center, and thank you for allowing me time
19 to speak with you today.

20 We're very pleased to hear that the Commission is
21 looking into a holistic approach on how to potentially
22 prohibit the practice of seabed mining from taking place
23 off the coast of California. It's encouraging to receive
24 feedback from the Commission and a good explanation
25 regarding where the Commission stands on the issue and how

1 you plan to move forward with developing foundational
2 policies and regulations when considering potentially
3 granting leases to mining companies.

4 We will continue to engage on the issue, look
5 forward to hearing more from you in the new year, and
6 appreciate your hard work.

7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Casey.

9 Our next speaker?

10 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Next
11 speaker is Andrew Thurber.

12 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Andrew.

13 DR. THURBER: Good morning, and thank you for the
14 opportunity to provide public comment. My name's Andrew
15 Thurber. I'm an assistant professor of oceanography at
16 Oregon State University and I'm an expert in marine
17 ecosystem function and services.

18 My views that I'm expressing today are my own and
19 not meant to be representative of my employer.

20 First off I'd really like to commend you on your
21 draft Strategic Plan, as it was a visionary statement and
22 it was inclusive of focusing on climate issues including
23 aspirational views of a realized post-petroleum era.

24 I also applaud moving away from non-renewable
25 extractive land uses, as this is an appropriate and lofty

1 goal.

2 As climate change impacts were specifically
3 identified in the plan, through listening and during
4 previous Commission meetings and also reading previous
5 public testimony, seabed mining was a further identified
6 threat to what California State Lands can provide. Seabed
7 mining is non-renewable land use.

8 Within your draft plan I particularly appreciated
9 the Commission's inclusion of a collaborative dialogue
10 approach towards evaluating non-renewable uses. When
11 discussing ocean uses, studies have found broad public
12 support for a no-net loss of biodiversity, and in
13 particular protection for habitats that lead to healthy
14 fisheries.

15 Biodiversity in the ocean is driven by habitat
16 diversity. Habitat diversity is created by many of the
17 same compounds that are a potential foci of mining from
18 shallow to deep waters including California state-managed
19 lands. The hard substrate that is often a focus of mining
20 operations can provide substrate for kelp forests, deep
21 rocky reefs, and other habitats that add to the
22 biodiversity of California's coast and also lead to
23 economic diversity including supporting healthy fish
24 stocks.

25 Mining removes this underlying habitat diversity

1 and can impact ocean function and what society gets from
2 it including recreation, tourism, and recreational and
3 commercial fishing success. Those things that have also
4 been identified as significant value in scientific studies
5 on what people value.

6 The ocean, its habitats, and its ecosystems are
7 also highly connected. I personally think of the ocean as
8 everyone's backyard but nobody has any fences. What
9 happens in one habitat impacts adjacent habitats and also
10 what we get from the ocean. Sediment plumes, loss of
11 habitat and the release of potentially harmful compounds
12 have wide range in the unintended impacts on the marine
13 environment.

14 In addition these impacts are hard to study. A
15 fish ecologist friend of mine says counting fish is like
16 counting trees except they're invisible and they move.
17 Quantifying impacts of marine mining is just as nefarious
18 and the impacts are uni-directional, potentially forever,
19 and often with widespread and unexpected consequences due
20 to the connected aspect of ocean ecosystem. This creates
21 a real challenge for management and, in particular,
22 land-use management.

23 For that, I applaud your including an approach of
24 collaborative dialogue and movement towards critical and
25 informed evaluation of non-renewable land use.

1 I personally support, based on my area of
2 expertise, identifying seabed mining is a type of the
3 future that is not in line with the just transition to
4 renewables and in particular due to its potential
5 widespread and connected impact on California's vibrant
6 coastal ecosystem and economies.

7 Thank you for your time.

8 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Andrew.
9 Katie our next speaker, please.

10 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: The
11 next speaker is Tom Rudolph.

12 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Tom.

13 MR. RUDOLPH: Good morning, Chair Yee, members of
14 the Commission and staff.

15 Can you hear me okay?

16 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes, we can.

17 MR. RUDOLPH: Great.

18 For the record, my name is Tom Rudolph and I'm
19 speaking on behalf of the Pew Charitable Trusts. I'm here
20 today to commend your efforts to date in the development
21 of this new Strategic Plan draft, to express our support
22 and appreciation for the language in the draft that is
23 intended to incorporate and address the concerns we have
24 raised throughout 2020 about the inevitable emergence of
25 interest in seabed mining on and under submerged lands

1 that you hold in trust, and to offer some preliminary
2 suggestions for improvements to that language.

3 As we stated previously, the thoughtful and
4 accessible manner in which you all developed this draft
5 and the fact that you've kept the effort on track and on
6 time in this year of unprecedented challenges is truly
7 impressive.

8 We're pleased to see that the Commission is
9 proposing a collaborative and comprehensive effort to look
10 broadly at extractive uses of state lands and to evaluate
11 the need for policy or regulatory change in the context of
12 the transition to renewable uses under the evolving
13 mandates of the Public Trust Doctrine. This proposed
14 commitment and the activities it envisions found in Goal
15 4A under the evolving Public Trust Doctrine focus area,
16 look like a good way to begin reviewing the Commission's
17 current regulatory regime for marine minerals and to
18 consider our proposals for reform.

19 The first time I had the opportunity to address
20 you all on this topic earlier this year I told you all how
21 exciting I found your use of the word "evolving" in the
22 context of the Public Trust Doctrine, and I greatly
23 appreciate how much you've drilled down on that concept in
24 this new draft.

25 I want to highlight some language from page 13 in

1 the narrative section that explores evolving Public Trust
2 principles and values as a driver of change, that
3 describes the protection of ecosystem integrity for
4 current and future generations as a foundational
5 responsibility. Our concerns and proposed solutions
6 relative to marine mining are grounded in an
7 ecosystem-based approach and are very much related to the
8 potential for marine mining to cause disruptions in
9 ecosystem structure, function, and services that are long
10 term or even irreversible in nature. This leads to our
11 first preliminary suggestion for strengthening this draft.

12 In our letter to the Commission for this meeting
13 we further explore prior suggestions we had submitted of
14 focusing on ecosystem services in any treatment of seabed
15 mining. And I think and hope that those suggestions are
16 very applicable to the effort envisioned under Call To
17 Action 4 and its underlying Goal 4A. I encourage you to
18 consider factoring those concepts into any further
19 development of the 4A convening in this plan and, as work
20 unfolds, after a final plan is adopted.

21 Also in light of our specific concerns about
22 seabed mining we'd also like to request that 4A explicitly
23 call out that potential extractive activity as an example
24 of a Commission-managed use that's in need of
25 collaborative attention and careful evaluation. And we

1 would also like to suggest the addition of a second bullet
2 that clearly communicates a commitment to action in the
3 form of promoting and adopting any policy changes for
4 which a need is identified under the convening activities
5 in 4A.

6 We'll remain enthusiastically engaged in this
7 process through the submission of more detailed written
8 comments later -- early next year and at any collaborative
9 dialogue that emerges from the ideas inherent in this
10 draft.

11 And we thank you all sincerely for your attention
12 to our concerns and your continued efforts.

13 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Tom, very much for
14 your comments.

15 Katie, our next speaker?

16 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Yes.
17 Our next speaker is Andrea Treece.

18 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Andrea.

19 MS. TREECE: Good morning, Chair Yee, members of
20 the Commission, and Commission staff. My name is Andrea
21 Treece, and I'm speaking on behalf of Earthjustice.

22 I first want to thank the Commission and staff
23 for the incredible amount of work that has gone into the
24 draft plan and the really thoughtful way that you've
25 integrated stakeholder input. I'll just offer some

1 preliminary comments on the draft this morning that look
2 forward offering more in-depth comments as the process
3 continues.

4 Also want to just note the breadth and importance
5 of the topics the draft addresses, the forward-looking
6 focus on climate change and environmental justice,
7 incorporating tribal knowledge and really focusing on
8 public health and sustainability.

9 We particularly appreciate the draft plan's focus
10 on the evolving Public Trust values and the opportunities
11 inherent in that area to proactively consider and
12 foreclose destructive non-renewable activities like seabed
13 mining.

14 As we noted in our prior written comments, the
15 California Public Trust Doctrine has evolved, as the
16 Commission is recognizing, to recognize the critical value
17 of conserving trust lands for uses like providing habitat
18 for fish and wildlife, for scientific study, as well as
19 supporting public health. And of course, all of those
20 things support economic and social concerns such as
21 fisheries and recreation in coastal communities.

22 We fully support the Commission's intent to
23 fulfill and further this evolving doctrine by placing a
24 priority on sustainability and justice. And in that vein,
25 we encourage the Commission to -- to keep and strengthen

1 its Goal 4 under the evolving Public Trust issues bullet
2 to explicitly include seabed mining as one of the
3 non-renewable practices the Commission will examine, and
4 further encourage the Commission to add the goal of
5 proposing and adopting proactive policies that prohibit
6 non-renewable extractive practices on State Lands, and
7 support a just transition to renewables.

8 We believe that this goal is an important one and
9 will really help the Commission to address conservation,
10 health, and sustainability of our coastal resources. We
11 look forward to working with you on these issues. And
12 thanks again so much for your effort and time.

13 Hope everyone has safe and happy holidays.

14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Andrea, for your
16 comments.

17 Our next speaker, Katie?

18 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Next
19 speaker is with Channel Islands Restoration.

20 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning.

21 MR. OWEN: Good morning, Chair Yee and members of
22 the Commission. I'm Ken Owen, Executive Director of
23 Channel Islands Restoration. We're a nonprofit habitat
24 restoration contractor based in Santa Barbara. We restore
25 habitat on the Channel Islands and adjacent mainland in

1 Ventura, LA, and Santa Barbara County.

2 This draft Strategic Plan is really from my
3 perspective a wonderful vision of sustainability and
4 public health for State Lands for the years to come. And
5 I'm -- like everyone, I'm really impressed with the work
6 by the staff and the Commission especially during these
7 hard times on this amazing document.

8 I'd like to address again the issue of seabed
9 mining, and I'd like to thank the staff for addressing the
10 issue of potentially prohibiting the practice in the
11 draft.

12 I see the draft as a great step forward. Just my
13 first thoughts developing meaningful -- towards developing
14 meaningful policies and regulations that potentially
15 prohibit seabed mining.

16 If I had any suggestions on the draft it would be
17 kind of along the lines of what others have said. I --
18 perhaps I'd respectfully suggest that you more explicitly
19 acknowledge the numerous comments that you've received on
20 the issue of seabed mining. And I agree -- I'll just save
21 you the time on the actions of -- that others have
22 suggested in 4A.

23 With that, I too would like to wish you a safe
24 and hopefully happy holiday season.

25 Thank you.

1 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Ken, very much.

2 Our next speaker?

3 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Next
4 speaker is Jennifer Savage.

5 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Jennifer.

6 MS. SAVAGE: Hi. Good morning, Chair Yee,
7 commissioners. Jennifer Savage, Surfrider Foundation.

8 We wanted to add our kudos to your staff for
9 developing this plan, despite the unforeseen and extreme
10 challenges of 2020. And while we're still taking a deep
11 dive into the draft plan, at first glance we're quite
12 heartened by the number of elements, including the
13 attention to educating people about the Public Trust and
14 the intention to work with a broad range of stakeholders
15 in addressing sea-level rise, especially tribal
16 representatives whose traditional ecological knowledge
17 will be critical to successful adaptation in the future.

18 As discussed at the start of the year, the
19 transition off fossil fuels, that was imperative, isn't
20 easy. So full attention must be given to how to do so in
21 the fastest, fairest manner. On that note, Surfrider
22 echoes our colleague's recommendations regarding a minor
23 addition of language to Goal 4A, further defining
24 non-renewable extractive practices as including but not
25 limited to seabed mining.

1 With that, we congratulate your staff and we look
2 forward to submitting far more detailed written comments
3 next month.

4 Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Jennifer.

6 Our next speaker?

7 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Next
8 speaker is Mona Tucker.

9 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good morning, Mona.

10 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Mona,
11 you might need to unmute yourself.

12 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Mona, are you there?

13 If you can hear me, you are probably on mute.

14 MS. TUCKER: I'm very sorry for the delay.

15 Can you hear me now?

16 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes, we can. Thank you.
17 Welcome.

18 MS. TUCKER: (Spoke in native language) Hello, my
19 friends. My name is Mona Olivas Tucker, and I'm the
20 Tribal Chair for yak tityu tityu yak tilhini, a northern
21 Chumash tribe of San Luis Obispo County and region. And
22 good morning to Chairperson Yee and to the rest of the
23 Commission.

24 I want to thank you for the excellent outreach to
25 the tribal communities by your exceptional staff regarding

1 this Strategic Plan. I'm hearten to read it. We will be
2 making some comments.

3 And I'm also grateful that the timeline for
4 comment has been extended. For a non-federally recognized
5 tribe, we typically do not have staff or resources to call
6 on, and so it does take us more time than maybe others.
7 So we're appreciative of that, appreciative of this work
8 overall, and we appreciate everyone's time this morning.

9 My only suggestion to everybody here in all of
10 your comments, which I can say I agree with almost all of
11 them, is that to be thinking what you would like to see a
12 hundred years from now, because what we're doing today
13 will have impact, long-term, long -- far-reaching impact.
14 We actually look further out than that. Coming from
15 people who've been here for well over 10,000 years, we
16 really want to suggest to you, recommend to you that you
17 think in very far-reaching terms, a hundred, 500, even a
18 thousand years.

19 And that's the end of my comments, and thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Mona. We
21 look forward to your further comments. And thank you for
22 the encouragement to look beyond just the time frame of
23 our Strategic Plan.

24 Our next speaker, Katie?

25 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Our

1 next speaker is Patricia McPherson.

2 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay.

3 Good morning.

4 MS. MCPHERSON: Good morning. And thank you for
5 allowing me to speak.

6 Patricia McPherson again with Grassroots
7 Coalition. I am very glad to see this draft, and we will
8 be responding as well. And I appreciate the language from
9 the other speakers, and I very much appreciate the -- the
10 tribal language that you have in here for respect.

11 And I would like to bring to your attention for
12 climate change and sea-level rise: One of the issues
13 that -- I have gone to numerous meetings on sea-level rise
14 and workshops, and I found a critical gap of information,
15 and our lack of address altogether, regarding
16 acknowledging, understanding, and protecting coastal
17 fresh-water aquifers, such as exist at the Ballona gap in
18 Los Angeles.

19 We've been told at these meetings that specific
20 studies for specific areas still need to be performed in
21 order to address coastal fresh-water aquifers and their
22 protection.

23 But what I don't find is this issue being
24 addressed overall when it comes to sea-level rise. And we
25 would like to see that addressed as well.

1 We would also like to remind State Lands
2 Commission of sea-level rise and salt water corrosion
3 issues, that in particular here in the Los Angeles area we
4 have SoCalGas underground gas storage operations, and
5 their wells are affected by salt water corrosion. So what
6 we would like to have the assistance from the State Lands
7 Commission is to -- well, number one, not to waste public
8 dollars in the creation of further salt water intrusion
9 and inundation problems, but to also not create problems
10 from that corrosion of that salt water upon wells that are
11 oil and gas wells that we are still trying to protect the
12 public from the leakage that has given rise as a result of
13 that corrosion.

14 So just to bring that to your attention.

15 And, again, thank you very much that you are
16 working on these issues. And I'm very pleased to see this
17 draft, and we will be commenting on it.

18 Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Patricia.

20 Next speaker?

21 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Chair
22 Yee, we have no other hands raised for public comment.

23 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Katie.

24 Commissioners, let me just look to you. Any
25 other comments or questions at this point?

1 Okay. Seeing none.

2 Thank you to all of those speakers. Thank you
3 for the presentation. We do look forward to additional
4 submissions of public comment by February 1st of 2021.
5 And you can do that by email via the email address
6 strategicplan@slc.ca.gov, or you can phone in your
7 comments at 916-574-1800. All of this information is on
8 the State Lands Commission website.

9 So thank you very for the robust presentation and
10 all of the public comment.

11 Let's move on to the next item, which is Item 61.
12 And this is to consider approval of the legislative
13 report, the 2021 Biennial Report of the California Marine
14 Invasive Species Program.

15 May we have the presentation.

16 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Yes. Our senior
17 environmental scientist Lina Ceballos Osuna will be
18 presenting on behalf of the Commission. And her
19 presentation will be loading shortly.

20 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you.

21 Good afternoon, Lina.

22 (Thereupon a slide presentation.)

23 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

24 Thank you, Jennifer. Good morning, Madam Chair,
25 commissioners. My name is Lina Ceballos Osuna, and I am a

1 senior environmental scientist with the Marine Invasive
2 Species Program. I'll be presenting the Biennial Report
3 on the California Marine Invasive Species Program for your
4 consideration and approval.

5 Next slide.

6
7 --o0o--

8 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

9 The purpose of this report is to provide an
10 update to the Legislature from the Marine invasive Species
11 Program activities during the period of January 2018 to
12 December 2019.

13 The report includes a summary of vessel-reported
14 data, an update on implementation of ballast water
15 discharge performance standards, the most recent research
16 related to invasive species, and the main accomplishments
17 of the program during this time.

18 Additionally we present the next steps for the
19 program and the recommendations to the Commission and the
20 Legislature.

21 Next slide.

22 --o0o--

23 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

24 Nonindigenous species are organisms that are
25 intentionally or unintentionally transported through human

1 activities to new habitats. Once established, they can
2 become invasive, posing significant threats to human
3 health, the economy, and the environment.

4 Next slide.

5 --o0o--

6 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

7 Shipping is responsible for up to 79 percent of
8 established aquatic nonindigenous species in North
9 America. Commercial ships transport organisms to ballast
10 water and vessel biofouling. Prevention of species
11 introductions through vector management is the most
12 effective way to protect California waters from
13 nonindigenous species.

14 Next slide.

15 --o0o--

16 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

17 The Marine Invasive Species Program is a
18 statewide multi-agency program designated to prevent the
19 introduction of nonindigenous species from vessels
20 arriving at California ports.

21 Next slide.

22 --o0o--

23 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

24 In this graph, we show the number of vessels
25 arriving at California ports per year since 2010. During

1 2018 and 2019, California ports received about 11,000
2 arrivals per year. Over the past decade, the number of
3 arrivals has been trending upwards.

4 Next slide.

5 --o0o--

6 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

7 The most common management approach used by
8 vessels in California continues to be no discharging or
9 retaining ballast water while at our ports. During the
10 reporting period approximately 85 percent of vessel
11 arrivals did not discharge ballast water, presenting zero
12 risk of ballast water-mediated introductions. For those
13 vessels that discharge it, ballast water exchange was the
14 most common management method used. However, the use of
15 alternative methods and specifically the use of ballast
16 water treatment systems is increasing rapidly.

17 Next slide.

18 --o0o--

19 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

20 The Marine Invasive Species Act mandates the
21 Commission to inspect at least 25 percent of vessels
22 arriving at California ports to assess compliance with
23 ballast water and biofouling regulations. Commission
24 staff face challenges meeting the mandate during the
25 two-year reporting period due to personnel shortages and

1 access limitations at some ports. There have been ongoing
2 challenges recruiting and filling vacancies in the
3 inspectors classification because the job requirements are
4 outdated.

5 Next slide.

6 --o0o--

7 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

8 The Marine Invasive Species Program had many
9 accomplishments during the past two years. One of the
10 most notable was the high compliance rate observed. More
11 than 97 percent of all California arrivals were compliant
12 with both ballast water and biofouling management
13 regulations.

14 Less than 1 percent of ballast water discharged
15 in California was noncompliant.

16 And 96 percent of the vessels that eventually
17 were found noncompliant with the biofouling regulations
18 corrected the deficiency after the initial inspection.

19 Next slide.

20 --o0o--

21 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

22 In 2018, the latest ballast water treatment
23 technology assessment report was submitted to the
24 Legislature. In response to our recommendations in this
25 report, the Legislature passed Assembly Bill 912, delaying

1 implementation of the California interim and final ballast
2 water discharge standards. This bill also authorized the
3 Commission to adopt and implement federal ballast water
4 discharge standards.

5 Commission staff began the formal rulemaking
6 process for these regulations in November and currently we
7 are in the public comment period until January 19, 2021.

8 Next slide.

9 --o0o--

10 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

11 In late 2018, the federal Vessel Incidental
12 Discharge Act, also known as VIDA, was signed into law.
13 When fully implemented VIDA will preempt the state's
14 authority to adopt or implement the state-specific vessel
15 discharge management requirements or the standards. The
16 states will retain authority to inspect vessels, enforce
17 federal requirements and continue to collect reporting
18 form and fees with some restrictions.

19 After VIDA implementation, the California Marine
20 Invasive Species Control Fund is projected to lose between
21 300,000 and 500,000 revenue each year due to a cap on
22 vessel arrival fees. This loss will push the fund towards
23 insolvency by Fiscal Year 2024.

24 As a reminder, the Marine Invasive Species
25 Program is entirely funded by vessel arrival fees.

1 Next slide.

2 --o0o--

3 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

4 Over the next two years, the Marine Invasive
5 Species Program will work on high priority actions
6 including the adoption of the federal ballast water
7 discharge performance standards and development of
8 protocols to assess vessel compliance. We will amend the
9 enforcement regulations to incorporate both ballast water
10 and biofouling violations, implement the new pre-arrival
11 risk assessment process to more effectively and
12 efficiently allocate inspection resources, track vessel
13 patterns to analyze the effect of the recession caused by
14 the COVID-19 pandemic, and actively engage and participate
15 in the process to implement VIDA.

16 Next slide.

17 --o0o--

18 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

19 The staff requests your approval of the report
20 including the following recommendations to the
21 Legislature: Support the Commission's effort to remove
22 recruitment barriers for the inspector's job specification
23 to enable a larger, more diverse, and maximally inclusive
24 pool of candidates to better reflect the people of
25 California.

1 Work collaboratively with all the stakeholders
2 and the regulated community to secure ongoing funding for
3 the Marine Invasive Species Control Fund, to mitigate
4 impact of VIDA and the impact of the reduction in shipping
5 traffic due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

6 And to support the amendment of the Revenue and
7 Taxation Code to ensure efficient and effective fee
8 collection.

9 Finally, to support the reintroduction of passage
10 of Assembly Joint Resolution 25, to signal California's
11 opposition to preemption of state authority under VIDA.

12 Next slide.

13 --o0o--

14 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:

15 With that, I would like to thank you, and I'll be
16 happy to answer any questions.

17 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Lina, for the
18 presentation.

19 Commissioners, any questions or comments?

20 Yes, Commissioner Miller.

21 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you so much,
22 Madam Chair.

23 Just very briefly. The work on this is
24 incredible, and just huge kudos to the staff.

25 We are going to abstain just because of the

1 interaction with the Legislature, but certainly want to
2 send our great thanks to all the work that's been done and
3 the remarkable work and presentation by Ms. Ceballos.

4 Thank you very much.

5 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Commissioner Miller.

6 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: I will -- should -- I
7 will move --

8 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes.

9 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Yes?

10 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes.

11 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: And also want to add my
12 recognition of the hard work of the staff on this.

13 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great, thank you, Commissioner
14 Kounalakis.

15 A motion by Commissioner Kounalakis to approve
16 the legislative report. I will second that motion.

17 And I just had one question that -- it had to do
18 with the federal standards versus the California
19 standards.

20 And could you just remind us again about I guess
21 the differences, because I think one of the things I'm
22 mindful of, but just kind of going forward, is -- with any
23 of our State agencies, is whether we've had to adopt
24 federal standards that may have been less robust than
25 state standards, and whether that should be an area of

1 focus going forward.

2 EXECUTVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Lina, go ahead,
3 unless you would like to have Nicole answer.

4 But please.

5 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA: I
6 can answer that, I think.

7 Yeah, California interim and final ballast water
8 performance standards are more stringent. And currently
9 there is not an available technology to meet those
10 standards. So, based on the -- on the technology
11 assessment report, the recommendations in that report, and
12 the Assembly Bill 912 --

13 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes.

14 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:
15 -- it was decided that a -- if we adopt federal
16 standards, at least we can assess compliance and enforce.

17 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. All right. Thank you.

18 SENIOR ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST CEBALLOS OSUNA:
19 Nicole, I don't know if you want to complement
20 that answer.

21 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. No. Appreciate that.
22 Thank you.

23 All right. So we have a motion and a second.
24 But before we move to the vote, Katie, let me check in and
25 see if there are any public comments on this item.

1 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Thank
2 you, Chair Yee.

3 At this time we have no hands raised for public
4 comment.

5 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you.

6 All right. Ms. Lucchesi, would you take the
7 roll.

8 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Certainly.

9 Commissioner Kounalakis?

10 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Aye.

11 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Commissioner Miller?

12 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: I'm abstaining. I'm
13 sorry, I can barely hear you, Ms. Lucchesi.

14 Thank you.

15 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Chair Yee?

16 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Aye.

17 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: The motion passes 2
18 to 0, with Commissioner Miller abstaining.

19 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you very much.

20 Thank you for the presentation.

21 Okay. Moving on to our next item.

22 Item 62 is a progress report on the Commission's
23 second year implementation of the new Environmental
24 Justice Policy.

25 May we have the presentation.

1 Actually before we move on, I'm mindful of just
2 the staff monitoring the virtual meeting. Does anybody
3 need a break?

4 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: I am looking at Kim,
5 our meeting liaison, and our court reporter.

6 It looks like we're -- we can continue.

7 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Very well.

8 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Thank you, Chair
9 Yee.

10 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you.

11 Sure.

12 So we are on the Environmental Justice Policy.

13 May we have the presentation.

14 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: While this
15 presentation is loading, I would like to introduce the
16 Commission and the public to our new Environmental Justice
17 Liaison, Yessica Ramirez. I did introduce her at the
18 October meeting, but this the her first presentation to
19 the Commission and to the public. And I'm just so
20 grateful she has joined our team. She is amazing, that
21 you will find her to be extremely great at her job. So,
22 we're very --

23 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you.

24 Thank you. Good afternoon, Yessica, and welcome.

25 (Thereupon a slide presentation.)

1 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: Oh, thank
2 you, Jennifer, for those kind words.

3 And thank you, Madam Chair and commissioners. My
4 name is Yessica Ramirez, as stated, and I am the new
5 Environmental Justice Liaison at the Commission.

6 I started my role at the beginning of October,
7 and since then have immersed myself in learning the ins
8 and outs of the Commission and our Environmental Justice
9 Policy.

10 Hiring an Environmental Justice Liaison was one
11 of the Commission's goals this year. And I am honored to
12 have been selected to serve the Commission and the people
13 of California.

14 Over this past year, our staff and internal
15 environmental justice team have diligently and carefully
16 worked to implement the Commission's Environmental Justice
17 Policy. Today I will provide an update on our progress
18 during the second year of implementation.

19 Next slide, please.

20 --o0o--

21 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: Much like
22 our first year, staff has worked internally and externally
23 on policy implementation, collaborating with the
24 environmental justice organizations, tribal government
25 representatives, and other agencies to implement the

1 Policy.

2 Today, I will provide a brief overview of our
3 policy, discuss interagency partnerships and staff
4 trainings. I will also discuss the development of
5 processes for environmental justice outreach, and
6 launching a new Justice, Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion
7 Team.

8 I will conclude with an outlook for the year
9 ahead.

10 Next slide, please.

11 --o0o--

12 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: When the
13 Commission adopted a comprehensive Environmental Justice
14 Policy and implementation framework in 2018, it committed
15 to the principle that past environmental injustices will
16 not define California's future. And that commitment is
17 just as important today, if not more so, than it was in
18 2018.

19 The policy outlines 12 goals, reflecting input
20 from community outreach and guidance from environmental
21 justice -- from an environmental justice working group.

22 They are also reflective of climate change and
23 how the impacts on human health disproportionately affect
24 marginalized and disadvantaged communities.

25 As the Commission works to adapt to climate

1 change and promote climate resiliency, addressing
2 environmental justice will be imperative. This year
3 presented new challenges because of the COVID-19 pandemic,
4 which shifted how we approach our work. The pandemic
5 created additional barriers to participating in government
6 processes, further constraining the limit of capacity and
7 resources many environment justice organizations and
8 tribal communities already experience.

9 Staff is working diligently to ensure equitable
10 public participation during this challenging time.

11 Next slide, please.

12 --o0o--

13 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: I would
14 like to highlight three key activities staff was involved
15 in this year. They are a community outreach and
16 engagement workshop, developing a train-the-trainer guide
17 on how to effectively conduct community outreach and
18 engagement, and participation in an interagency
19 coordination group.

20 Next slide, please.

21 --o0o--

22 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ:

23 Meaningful community outreach and engagement are
24 foundational to environmental justice. When Governor
25 Newsom signed AB 1628 (Rivas) into law in September 2019,

1 he amplified changing California's definition of
2 environmental justice to include the meaningful
3 involvement of people of all races, cultures, income, and
4 national origins. This change aligns with the focus of
5 the Commission's partnership earlier this year with the
6 California Environmental Protection Agency, Department of
7 Conservation, State Water Resources Control Board,
8 California Public Utilities Commission, California
9 Department of Public Health, and the Leadership Counsel
10 for Justice and Accountability, to develop an in-depth
11 workshop outreach -- on outreach and engagement from the
12 State agency and community organization perspective.

13 This team developed a model curriculum and held
14 and all day workshop in February of this year.

15 The training, attended by about 130 staff from
16 multiple agencies, included modules, panels, interactive
17 activities, and firsthand accounts on the ways to
18 effectively engage communities.

19 Many agency staff have expressed a lack of
20 training and understanding about how to engage communities
21 in their agency's processes. This curriculum helped fill
22 a critical gap and provided staff with education and tools
23 to engage more meaningfully with community members.

24 And the partnerships and relationships that were
25 created from this training, having enriched our staff,

1 improve how we implement our policy, and helped us achieve
2 environmental justice in our work.

3 Next slide, please.

4 --o0o--

5 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: This same
6 interagency team is developing a train-the-trainer guide
7 and curriculum based on the materials and presentations
8 from the workshop. This material will be hosted alongside
9 other online engagement resources on the California
10 Natural Resources Agency's website.

11 Next slide, please.

12 --o0o--

13 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: Another
14 way that staff is implementing the Environmental Justice
15 Policy is through interagency coordination.

16 Staff is part of an environmental justice
17 partnership that includes the Coastal Commission, Coastal
18 Conservancy, Ocean Protection Council, BCDC, and NOAA.
19 Staff participates in monthly coordination calls with
20 these agencies to discuss equity and environmental justice
21 in our work.

22 Next slide, please.

23 --o0o--

24 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: Staff
25 developed a worksheet that our Land Management and Mineral

1 Resources Management divisions are used to determine when
2 environmental justice outreach is necessary. This past
3 year, staff sent nearly 600 letters related to 21 lease
4 applications or proposed projects. Among the key actions
5 that involved environmental justice outreach this year are
6 two geothermal leases issued at the October -- at the
7 October meeting.

8 Consistent with its Environmental Justice Policy,
9 staff evaluated the location of the proposed lease areas
10 to determine whether environmental burdens, should there
11 be any, would disproportionately impact nearby
12 communities. Staff outreached to environmental justice
13 communities and sought input on the proposed leases.

14 Staff contacted 45 individuals and
15 representatives of the environmental justice organizations
16 and 28 tribal representatives to notify them and solicit
17 comments.

18 Next slide, please.

19 --o0o--

20 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: So moving
21 on, I'm excited to announce that staff recently launched a
22 Justice, Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Team. This new
23 team, known as our JEDI Team, is a participatory
24 decision-making team dedicated to promoting equity,
25 inclusion, and diversity in addressing environmental

1 justice within the Commission and through its work. The
2 JEDI Team complements the goals in our Environmental
3 Justice Policy, and is intended to build on the efforts of
4 the Commission's Environmental Justice and Government
5 Alliance on Race and Equity teams.

6 Next slide, please.

7 --o0o--

8 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: As you
9 know, the Commission is developing a new Strategic Plan.
10 This new plan together with our Environmental Justice
11 Policy implementation blueprint will provide the framework
12 that guides our work in the years to come. In summary,
13 although 2020 has been an incredibly difficult year, we
14 have continued to make progress with implementing the
15 Commission's Environmental Justice Policy and our
16 commitment to environmental justice is stronger than ever.

17 Staff intends to continue to sustain and deepen
18 interagency partnerships and relationships with
19 environmental justice communities and advocates. Staff
20 also intends to leverage the new strategic plan once
21 adopted to guide how it prioritizes implementation of its
22 Environmental Justice Policy.

23 Another area where staff expects to see growth in
24 the coming year is in the intersection between climate
25 change and environmental justice.

1 I am sure there will be many other ways we will
2 be implementing the policy in 2021 as we continue to grow,
3 learn, and adapt.

4 Next slide, please.

5 --o0o--

6 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: The
7 Commission and its staff have enthusiastically embraced
8 the challenge to implement an Environmental Justice Policy
9 that is meaningful to the communities it serves and to the
10 people of California.

11 We are incredibly thankful for the work our
12 internal environmental justice team and Commission staff
13 have invested to implement the policy; and we are excited
14 to continue to build on these efforts.

15 We are especially grateful to the considerable
16 support from the Commission's executive leadership and
17 from the commissioners.

18 We are also especially grateful to the community
19 advocates that have taken time to engage with us and share
20 their perspectives and suggestions.

21 And, finally, we are grateful to our sister
22 agencies who we partner with. We have learned so much
23 from each other.

24 Thank you, and I am happy to answer any
25 questions.

1 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Yessica.
2 Questions or comments from commissioners?

3 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Well, again, just
4 another terrific presentation. And it's definitely the
5 day for it. But, you know, the emergence of equity and
6 environmental policy has really exploded in recognition
7 and understanding that we need to engage in this area.
8 It's been neglected for too long.

9 So, thank you, Jennifer and Yessica and staff for
10 keeping this in focus and ramping up our engagement.

11 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Commissioner
12 Kounalakis.

13 Just let me also thank the sustained focus on
14 this. You know, we really pride ourselves on doing our
15 work in partnership and certainly the interagency
16 coordination on so many issues. And having equity be --
17 and justice be at the core of that work is so important
18 across all of our sister agencies. And it's really -- I
19 have to say it's a very, very noticeable positive change.
20 And it's -- this is change that's not easy, doesn't come
21 easily. But at the same time, to see the commitment
22 already, just with so many of our key policy issues,
23 really dedicated to kind of a JEDI lens is really just
24 very, very promising. So thank you, and look forward to
25 the continued work.

1 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LIAISON RAMIREZ: Thank
2 you.

3 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you.

4 And let me turn to Katie to see if there are any
5 public comments on this item.

6 If anyone wishes to comment, please raise your
7 Zoom hand now on Item 62.

8 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Thank
9 you, Chair Yee.

10 At this time, we have no hands raised for public
11 comment.

12 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Very well.

13 Thank you very much, Yessica. Really look
14 forward to upcoming reports and progress on this.

15 Okay, Commissioners. We are now on Item 63.
16 This is also an informational update on aquaculture in
17 State and federal waters, including the establishment of
18 aquaculture opportunity areas in federal waters.

19 And we are going to have a presentation by I
20 believe one of our Sea Grant Fellows, yes?

21 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: That's right. Mark
22 Danielson will be giving the staff presentation. And
23 while his PowerPoint is loading, I just want to highlight
24 for the Commission, that the Commission employs Sea Grant
25 Fellows regularly each year. This year, we have been

1 lucky enough to host two Sea Grant Fellows, Mark Danielson
2 and Kristina Kunkel, who you'll be hearing from later.

3 And as I know you all know, all the commissioners
4 know, the Sea Grant Program and particularly the Sea Grant
5 Fellows that we've been lucky enough to host have just
6 been incredible, and have really raised our game in terms
7 of how we serve the public across all of our programs.
8 And so it's really with great honor and privilege to
9 introduce Mark to present to you on this important issue
10 that the Commission is facing along with our other partner
11 agencies.

12 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you.

13 Good afternoon, Mark, and welcome.

14 MR. DANIELSON: Thank you. Good afternoon, Chair
15 Yee and commissioners.

16 (Thereupon a slide presentation.)

17 MR. DANIELSON: My name is Mark Danielson and I
18 am a California Sea Grant Fellow at the Commission. And
19 during the last 10 months I have worked with Commission
20 staff on a variety of issues relating to marine spatial
21 planning. And an ever present theme throughout has been
22 the importance of California's coastal communities, and
23 the opportunities that a diverse blue economy can bring.

24 Aquaculture has existed in California for many
25 years. But renewed interest in expanding the aquaculture

1 industry could give it a more prominent role in
2 California's blue economy.

3 Today I will give an informational update on the
4 status of recent State and federal policies and strategies
5 relevant to the development of a more robust and
6 sustainable aquaculture industry in California.

7 Next slide, please.

8 --o0o--

9 MR. DANIELSON: First, I will go over the types
10 of existing aquaculture in State waters, the importance of
11 the industry, and how it relates to State Land
12 Commission's responsibilities.

13 Second, I will provide an update on the
14 development of a set of statewide aquaculture principles
15 by the Ocean Protection Council and aquaculture permitting
16 guidance document from the California Coastal Commission,
17 and the process to select aquaculture opportunity areas in
18 Southern California by the National Oceanic and
19 Atmospheric Administration.

20 Finally, I will talk about the next steps that
21 Commission staff intend to take regarding these
22 initiatives.

23 Next slide, please.

24 --o0o--

25 MR. DANIELSON: The aquaculture industry is a

1 significant part of the United States' blue economy. In
2 2017 the total value of marine and fresh water operations
3 was \$1.5 billion. Right now California's contribution to
4 that number is small, just over 1 percent of that total.
5 A recent report from the United Nations Food and
6 Agriculture Organization estimated that the U.S. imports
7 90 percent of the food that we eat. And half of that
8 comes from foreign aquaculture farms. The demand for
9 seafood is rising in the U.S., and the aquaculture
10 industry in California could grow to meet it.

11 Next slide, please.

12 --o0o--

13 MR. DANIELSON: Currently there are 17 active
14 marine aquaculture farms in State waters, the locations of
15 which are highlighted on this map. Many of these farms
16 are located on submerged and tidal sovereign land, granted
17 to local jurisdictions by the Legislature. Only seaweed
18 and shellfish are permitted for cultivation and the
19 harvesting in State waters. Some farms use the space
20 under and around piers and marinas to grow their products,
21 making efficient use of existing facilities, and
22 decreasing the need for more ocean space.

23 There is even emerging interest in repurposing
24 decommissioned oil platforms for seaweed and shellfish
25 cultivation. The role of the State Lands Commission in

1 the California aquaculture industry remains vital.

2 Next slide, please.

3 --o0o--

4 MR. DANIELSON: The Fish and Game Commission is
5 responsible for authorizing water bottom leases for
6 aquaculture. State Lands Commission staff often provide
7 advisory support to colleagues at Fish and Game due to our
8 expertise in leasing and managing Public Trust land and
9 resources.

10 In addition, the Commission leases some ancillary
11 structures associated with aquaculture farms, such as
12 docks and seawater intakes. Commission staff also
13 contribute to interagency working groups and efforts to
14 develop aquaculture policies and projects because of our
15 experience balancing benefits and impacts of Public Trust
16 uses and resources.

17 Next slide, please.

18 --o0o--

19 MR. DANIELSON: Aquaculture is highlighted in the
20 Ocean Protection Council's 2020 to 2025 Strategic Plan.
21 And in September of this year, the OPC authorized the
22 development of a statewide aquaculture action plan. The
23 purpose of the action plan is to promote a sustainable
24 commercial aquaculture industry in California. It will
25 outline a coordinated approach for considering, approving,

1 and managing proposed projects. While the
2 action plan is under development the OPC is creating
3 statewide aquaculture principles that will serve as
4 interim guidance to State agencies as well as industry
5 partners when considering and approving proposed
6 Aquaculture projects. Commission staff and folks from
7 other related agencies have engaged with OPC on this
8 effort by providing review and feedback. They are set to
9 be finalized soon. The Marine Resources Committee of the
10 Fish and Game Commission voted to continue the hiatus on
11 processing new lease applications until the Statewide
12 aquaculture principles are finalized, highlighting the
13 importance of these principles to the future development
14 of the industry.

15 Next slide, please.

16 --o0o--

17 MR. DANIELSON: The California Coastal Commission
18 has also been active in the realm of aquaculture this
19 year. In 2019, Senate Bill 262 directed the Coastal
20 Commission to develop guidance for applicants seeking
21 coastal development permits for aquaculture. The guidance
22 is meant to increase efficiency and reduce duplication
23 time and cost associated with the permitting process.
24 Staff from the Coastal Commission have been in
25 collaboration with State Lands Commission staff as well as

1 other agencies and stakeholders throughout this process.
2 And the final guidance document was just recently released
3 this month.

4 Next slide, please.

5 --o0o--

6 MR. DANIELSON: There is active interest in
7 aquaculture in federal waters off California as well. An
8 Executive Order issued in May of this year prompted NOAA
9 to identify aquaculture opportunity areas, or AOAs, in
10 specific regions of the U.S. Two regions have thus far
11 been identified: the Gulf of Mexico and Southern
12 California.

13 The process will result in the identification of
14 one AOA in the Southern California region as well as other
15 alternative areas. The actual AOAs are designed to be
16 small areas within these regions and are suitable for
17 sustainable offshore aquaculture.

18 According to NOAA, these AOAs will be identified
19 based on the best available science and current data on
20 ocean uses. They are evaluating extensive data sets on
21 fishing zones, vessel traffic patterns, whale and bird
22 migration routes, existing oil and gas lease locations,
23 and military uses.

24 The AOAs will offer opportunity not just for
25 shellfish and seaweed aquaculture but also for offshore

1 finfish operations. This process is three years; with the
2 spatial analysis and AOAs being identified in the first,
3 and a programmatic environmental impact statement for
4 aquaculture development within the AOA throughout the
5 following two years.

6 NOAA's staff has stated that they are committed
7 to extensive stakeholder engagement and a robust public
8 input process; and Commission staff are tracking this
9 process closely due to the potential for both impact and
10 benefits to Public Trust resources that could result from
11 the effort.

12 Next slide, please.

13 --o0o--

14 MR. DANIELSON: The next steps for Commission
15 staff will be to continue to engage with OPC staff to
16 finalize the statewide aquaculture principles. Commission
17 staff will also participate in the federal AOA
18 identification process including the development of the
19 programmatic environmental impact statement. Lessons
20 learned from previous marine spatial planning efforts by
21 the Commission, such as the San Diego Ocean Planning
22 Partnership, can be shared with NOAA, particularly
23 regarding the establishment of a robust stakeholder
24 outreach and public input process.

25 By providing our expertise to other federal and

1 State agency partners, Commission staff can ensure Public
2 Trust land and resources are fully considered and
3 protected in the growth of a sustainable aquaculture
4 industry. We can help drive the expansion of this
5 important sector of the blue economy through enhanced
6 cooperation, coordination, and alignment of State policies
7 and goals.

8 Next slide, please.

9 --o0o--

10 MR. DANIELSON: Thank you very much for your
11 attention, and I'm happy to answer any questions at this
12 time.

13 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you for the presentation,
14 Mark.

15 Questions or comments by commissioners?

16 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Thank you again for
17 this great presentation.

18 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yeah, it's an exciting
19 presentation.

20 I just had one question, Mark, and that is, I
21 think the statewide principles on aquaculture, does that
22 lend it just to seaweed and shellfish for now? I think --
23 is offshore finfish not going to be incorporated in the
24 principles initially while we're looking at what happens
25 in these opportunity areas?

1 MR. DANIELSON: That's correct. To my
2 understanding, it does not include offshore finfish
3 aquaculture. But in addition to shellfish and seaweed, it
4 will also include information on the finfish aquaculture
5 that we do permit --

6 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes.

7 MR. DANIELSON: -- on land.

8 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Right. Okay.

9 Thank you.

10 All right. Let's see if we have any public
11 comments on this item.

12 Katie?

13 We're now Item 63. If you do have any public
14 comment to offer to the Commission, please raise your Zoom
15 hand now.

16 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Chair
17 Yee, at this time, we have no hands raised for public
18 comment.

19 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Thank you very much.
20 Thank you again very much for the presentation, Mark. And
21 look forward to continuing progress in this area. Thank
22 you.

23 MR. DANIELSON: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON YEE: All right. We're now on Item
25 64, which is also an informational update on AB 691

1 relating to the legislatively granted Public Trust lands
2 and sea-level rise planning.

3 And we have a presentation by our other Sea Grant
4 Fellow joining us today.

5 Jennifer, do you want to introduce?

6 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Yes. It is also my
7 pleasure to introduce Kristina Kunkel, our other Sea Grant
8 Fellow, who's been working diligently on our AB 691
9 implementation along with a ton of other stuff she's been
10 helping us with. But we have really been able to make
11 significant progress on assessing the reports that have
12 been submitted because of the work that she's contributed
13 to this effort.

14 So it's my pleasure to introduce Kristina.

15 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great.

16 Good afternoon, Kristina, and welcome.

17 (Thereupon a slide presentation.)

18 MS. KUNKEL: Thank you, Chair Yee, commissioners.
19 My name is Kristina Kunkel and I am a Sea Grant Fellow
20 with the Commission.

21 Today I will provide a brief update on AB 691,
22 specifically the two-page summary reports that staff
23 developed this year in collaboration with consultant
24 Revell Coastal.

25 Next slide, please.

1 --o0o--

2 MS. KUNKEL: AB 691 was passed in 2013. It
3 requires local jurisdictions that were granted state land
4 by the Legislature and who generate over \$250,000 in
5 Public Trust revenues annually to prepare a sea-level rise
6 vulnerability assessment for the Commission. The
7 assessments had to include an inventory of the vulnerable
8 Public Trust land and assets, maps of sea-level rise for
9 2030, 2050, and 2100, financial costs of sea-level rise,
10 and a description of proposed adaptation strategies. The
11 assessments will inform the Commission on how to support
12 grantees adapting to sea-level rise and protecting state
13 land and Public Trust resources.

14 Earlier this year, we gave the Commission a
15 presentation about our work to review the full assessments
16 and identify challenges of the grantees encountered.
17 Since then we have been working on a draft summary report
18 that we will present early next year.

19 We have also organized the information from the
20 full length of assessments into concise two-page
21 summaries.

22 Next slide, please.

23 --o0o--

24 MS. KUNKEL: The two-page summaries are companion
25 pieces to the full assessments. After the initial

1 assessment reviews, it was clear the submissions reflected
2 a range of approaches and also a wide variety in length,
3 from less than 10 pages to more than 600 pages. Our
4 intention was to create a standard, easily digestible
5 format to communicate the most critical and noteworthy
6 findings to the public and decision makers, and also help
7 make it easier to compare and contrast vulnerabilities and
8 develop an analysis.

9 Next slide, please.

10 --o0o--

11 MS. KUNKEL: I'm going to highlight a couple of
12 the two-page summaries we have created. The first being
13 Port of San Diego; and the second is the city of the
14 Crescent City. We selected these two to feature because
15 the assessments they submitted were exemplary. These two
16 are models and we want to highlight and elevate their
17 stories.

18 Each two-page summary includes a site
19 description, a list of vulnerable Public Trust resources,
20 anticipated costs of sea-level rise, and proposed
21 adaptation and mitigation strategies. This is your window
22 into the full assessments to learn about each community,
23 the risks they face, and how they are preparing to protect
24 and adapt state land and resources for sea-level rise.

25 Next slide, please.

--o0o--

MS. KUNKEL: This is a snapshot of one section of the Port of San Diego's two-page summary: The anticipated cost of sea-level rise adaptation. Note that by 2100 the Port expects repair and replacement costs of facilities to potentially exceed a billion dollars if no action is taken to minimize risk.

As a major port, we expected high dollar amounts here, but this is very high. And it's not just damages to the structures. The Port and other grantees also estimated losses from impacts to beach tourism and recreation, and loss of habitats like salt marshes and eelgrass beds.

Due to a lack of detailed economic data for some of these risks, it is possible that the financial costs from sea-level rise will be even greater than what has been estimated in the assessments.

Next slide, please.

--o0o--

MS. KUNKEL: From our southernmost grantee to our northernmost grantee, here is Crescent City's two-page summary. You can see that the format is consistent with the Port of San Diego's.

Next slide, please.

--o0o--

1 MS. KUNKEL: Let's take a closer look at the
2 adaptation and mitigation measures proposed by the city of
3 Crescent City. They plan to implement a combination of
4 accommodation, protection, and retreat strategies. To
5 accommodate higher water levels they plan to elevate a
6 critical section of Redwood Highway as well as pedestrian
7 paths and public access points.

8 They plan to fortify a breakwater and implement a
9 beach nourishment program. And they will identify the
10 highest hazard area as to limit development there; and
11 plan for a retreat of the most vulnerable facilities and
12 assets.

13 Many grantees considered a similar set of options
14 to adapt to sea-level rise and make their coastal areas
15 more resilient to these risks.

16 Next slide, please.

17 --o0o--

18 MS. KUNKEL: Every grantee has its own unique
19 attributes that will influence how it will grapple with
20 sea-level rise. Each two-page summary highlights the
21 noteworthy element of the grantee's full length
22 assessment. For Crescent City we featured information
23 they provided on social equity, environmental justice, and
24 the needs of vulnerable communities.
25 Crescent City is in Del Norte County, one of the poorest

1 and most rural counties in the State that is often
2 overlooked and less likely to have the capacity and
3 resources to respond to sea-level rise and flooding. The
4 city plans to engage frequently with the fishing and
5 recreation communities, and will experience some of the
6 greatest -- that will experience some of the greatest
7 impacts so that strategies for adaptation meet their
8 needs.

9 Next slide, please.

10 --o0o--

11 MS. KUNKEL: Environmental justice was not
12 required to be addressed as part of the AB 691 assessment
13 process. But EJ and equity concerns quickly emerged
14 through our review.

15 If you look at these assessments individually,
16 it's difficult to see the magnitude of inequity that
17 sea-level rise impacts have on communities. But when we
18 put all of the pieces together, it is evident that there
19 is disproportionate damage done to low income communities
20 and communities of color as a result of sea-level rise.

21 We need to prioritize solutions that support
22 equitable adaptation. Planning for the future of rising
23 seas is important, but we should recognize that sea-level
24 rise is happening now, today. The dramatic photos of
25 flooding that have been included in this presentation have

1 all been captured during events in just the last few
2 years.

3 Next slide, please.

4 --o0o--

5 MS. KUNKEL: To further show you how vulnerable
6 some communities already are to sea-level rise, I just
7 want to tell you a little bit about research I did before
8 my fellowship, within the jurisdiction of one of our AB
9 691 grantees, Humboldt Harbor District.

10 As part of my thesis research at Humboldt State
11 University, I interviewed residents of King Salmon, a
12 community that floods regularly with King and high tides.
13 It is likely the most vulnerable area to sea-level rise on
14 the entire U.S. West Coast.

15 The average income of most residents is very low.
16 They do not have the resources to protect their
17 neighborhoods, nor leave them. The image on the right is
18 of me standing on the street in King Salmon last year,
19 measuring flood waters during the King tide.

20 The image on the left shows how much flooding may
21 occur by the end of the century on a monthly basis. All
22 of the parcels and the only access road to enter King
23 Salmon are completely inundated.

24 Nearby Highway 101 is under water at least
25 monthly, as is the PG&E power plant that provides energy

1 to the state's grid and stores spent nuclear fuel.

2 We could lose entire communities in just a few
3 decades without major interventions.

4 These individual locations do not only represent
5 the community that will be lost, but valuable shorelines
6 that matter to all people in California. The AB1 691
7 project can help the State figure out how to prioritize
8 support so that we can avoid the most catastrophic
9 consequences of sea-level rise.

10 Next slide, please.

11 --o0o--

12 MS. KUNKEL: We plan to post the two-page
13 summaries on our website by the end of next month. We are
14 also developing a comprehensive summary report, and will
15 present this to the Commission as early as the February
16 2021 meeting.

17 The link to our AB 691 website is right here; and
18 most of the full-length assessments are already available
19 at that link.

20 Next slide, please.

21 --o0o--

22 MS. KUNKEL: I want to thank the Commission for
23 the opportunity to participate in the Sea Grant Fellowship
24 this year. The work that you're doing and that I've been
25 able to participate in has truly been inspirational and

1 life changing.

2 Thank you, and I'm happy to answer any questions.

3 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Kristina.

4 Questions or comments, commissioners?

5 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: None, thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay.

7 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: Madam Chair?

8 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes, Commissioner Miller.

9 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: Just, again, a great
10 presentation to both our Sea Grant Fellows, and so great
11 to see folks committed to these issues and working so hard
12 on them.

13 I really appreciate your perspective on sea-level
14 rise and the potential impact and everything that the
15 Commission is doing to really work collaboratively not
16 only on this but on all the issues with our sister
17 agencies and across -- across departments I think will be
18 really important that we continue that coordination as we
19 go forward, because I think without that type of
20 coordination, we'll continue to see kind of siloed
21 approaches to this.

22 So just to you, Kristina, how do you see that
23 coordination working, and is there any way in which you
24 think that coordination could potentially improve in terms
25 of communication or planning, or a way to sort of execute

1 cross-government levels?

2 MS. KUNKEL: Whoa! Well, that's a big question,
3 and that's a great question. I mean I think that -- the
4 first thing I want to say - this isn't really going to
5 answer your question - but I want to talk about how
6 important it is to involve the community in these
7 decisions, because research shows that top-down climate
8 policy where government is just making decisions can
9 create conflict and resistance from communities when
10 actually implemented. So listening to and engaging
11 stakeholders affected by adaptation policy creates a
12 pathway for identifying critical social impacts prior to
13 policy implementation.

14 We know that the people who live in these
15 communities know their community better than anyone else.
16 So it's critical they're at the center of those planning
17 conversations. And that means planning public meetings,
18 engaging the community, building adaptive capacity. The
19 Commission already does a fantastic job of this through
20 implementation of your tribal and environmental justice
21 policies.

22 And then when it comes to planning
23 interagency-wide, I mean I just think that there needs to
24 be more of it. There needs to be more communication and
25 more interagency work groups. We need to be communicating

1 with each other. And not that we're not doing that
2 already, but I think that we can always improve.

3 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: And if I could,
4 through the Chair, add on to that.

5 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Please.

6 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Just a really
7 excellent explanation. And just to really elevate
8 Kristina's comment about focusing on community and
9 regional approaches. I think that is a pathway to help
10 align various State agencies in terms of mobilizing around
11 a particular region or community, to help them address
12 sea-level rise and adaptation and other kind of resiliency
13 efforts. We tend as agencies get into our silo -- in our
14 silos and when we change our focus to the communities and
15 the region, we can rally around unique needs and issues
16 and it helps us get out of -- us as agencies get out of
17 our silos.

18 So I just wanted to elevate the thoughts that
19 Kristina had because I thought they were spot on.

20 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Jennifer.

21 And, Kristina, thank you for putting a good deal
22 of attention on the issues of equity in your presentation
23 as well. I think -- and certainly your last comment
24 about, you know, really looking to our communities and our
25 stakeholders in terms of really helping us identify what

1 some of the pathways are is going to be very, very
2 important.

3 But, again, I just want to say congratulations on
4 the progress, because it just seems like we've moved so
5 quickly from receiving these assessments that were just
6 kind of all over the map, different formats from all kinds
7 of parties, and then to actually have it now be in a form
8 that we can actually communicate more easily to the
9 public. The two-page concise summaries I think are
10 fantastic. And that's not to say more refinement isn't
11 necessary. But, you know, really get to this point from
12 where we started I think is just really tremendous
13 progress. So thank you for being a part of that.

14 Let me look to Katie to see if there are any
15 public comments on this item. We are on Item 64. If you
16 do wish to provide a comment to the commission, please
17 raise your zoom hand now.

18 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Thank
19 you, Chair Yee. We do have Robert van de Hoek, who has
20 raised his hand.

21 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you.

22 Good afternoon, Robert.

23 MR. VAN DE HOEK: Good afternoon, Commissioner
24 Yee.

25 This was a really great presentation, and

1 appreciate it very much. And credit to you as the
2 commissioners and staff for doing this, and the California
3 public being interested in.

4 I think right off the bat, she -- Kristina was
5 very -- and the question she was asked, having the
6 community involved is -- because they have expertise as --
7 and that's me as an example, with a marine biology,
8 wildlife, oceanography background, studying California for
9 45 years along the seashore, from the Oregon border and
10 down into Mexico, there's a lot of observations I've been
11 making recently. Some of these are going to be hard to
12 swallow, in a sense. But since your mission or your --
13 kind of way you are looking at your commission -- State
14 Lands Commission to include sustainability, economic
15 viability but reasonably like -- don't remember the exact
16 phrase -- indigenous peoples and EJ, you know, and cost
17 benefit analysis. And all the research that's being done
18 in the last 10 years on our rivers and how they enter into
19 the sea, we now know that every single lagoon and estuary
20 on the California coast but one, San Francisco Bay, and
21 possibly a second one at San Diego, all the other ones
22 from Eureka and the Humboldt Bay, to Oceanside, to others
23 are -- were always closed to the sea every year, sometimes
24 for multiple years without opening, by sandbars. The
25 natural process of rivers bringing sand down to the ocean

1 caused the blockage to the sea - good blockage, I might
2 add - and -- for example, we now dredge Humboldt Bay
3 millions of dollars on an annual basis there alone. But
4 then if you look up and down the coast, federal dollars --
5 millions of dollars are being used, not in San Francisco
6 Bay or San Diego Bay because those are the natural
7 openings where the U.S. Navy and -- But over and over
8 again, we are dredging open with federal dollars, and
9 counties asking for it to be dredged, for yacht harbors
10 and that. And I think we're going to -- and that's one of
11 the ways that sea-level rise comes pouring in to flood
12 places on the coast. Like give you examples of salmon in
13 Humboldt County and -- et cetera.

14 And so adaptive management gets mentioned in
15 Kristina's presentation. But adaptive management means
16 thinking about what we've done with our harbors.
17 Unnatural man-made harbors. And the habitat that would be
18 gained if we terminated those harbors and did management
19 in a new way. I know that means recreational sailing
20 might be at issue. But this is the future. Climate
21 change.

22 Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Robert, for your
24 comments.

25 Our next speaker, Katie?

1 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Next
2 speaker is Lily Tsukayama.

3 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you.
4 Good afternoon.

5 MS. TSUKAYAMA: Good afternoon, Chair Yee,
6 commissioners, Executive Officer Lucchesi and staff.
7 Thank you for the opportunity to provide public comment on
8 this item today. My name is Lily Tsukayama, Associate
9 Planner with the Port of San Diego.

10 As a grantee of state lands, the Port is
11 appreciative of the statewide coordination that the
12 Commission has led on coastal rezoning sea efforts and
13 sea-level rise adaptation planning.

14 Going through the AB 691 process as a grantee, we
15 learned a lot about the vulnerability of San Diego Bay's
16 submerged land and tidelands to sea-level rise. And we
17 are humbled that this item today highlights our report.

18 I wanted to use my comments to briefly convey to
19 the Commission our we've been using our AB 691 report
20 since we submitted it last year.

21 Some examples include: Consistently using our
22 selective projections to identify appropriate adaptation
23 measures and project approvals, such as elevating existing
24 revetment for a new recreation open space area along the
25 shoreline and Harbor Park in Chula Vista, which was

1 recently approved by our board, advancing nature-based
2 solutions along our bay shoreline. For example, EConcrete
3 will soon be deployed in Harbor Island in north San Diego
4 Bay to replace existing shoreline armoring with modular
5 tide pools that will help to enhance biodiversity, along
6 with providing coastal resiliency benefits.

7 We are also in the process of permitting a native
8 oyster reef as a living shoreline in south San Diego Bay,
9 and we appreciate the Commission's support as well as the
10 State Coastal Conservancy's partnership on this effort.

11 We are currently building an internal GIS
12 application that includes our selected AB 691 sea-level
13 rise projections and results of the vulnerability
14 assessment, so that Port staff can leverage the data when
15 planning projects.

16 We've been working with Scripps Institution of
17 Oceanography and their Center for Climate Change Impacts
18 and Adaptation to monitor wave activity in San Diego Bay
19 and refine further sea-level rise models for future
20 assessments.

21 And more broadly, we continue to partner with
22 stakeholders in San Diego Bay such as the U.S. Navy and
23 jurisdictions along the San Diego coast to share knowledge
24 and best practices regarding sea-level rise. Our MOU with
25 the Navy is the first of its kind on the West Coast for

1 information and data sharing on coastal resiliency.
2 Coordination between the Port and Navy is essential to
3 protect some of the most vulnerable disadvantaged
4 neighboring communities which lie directly behind
5 Port-side working waterfront assets and Navy
6 Infrastructure. This was the type of collaboration that
7 will be needed for all of us in the San Diego region to
8 address this complex issue together.

9 We greatly appreciate our partnership with the
10 State Lands Commission on adaptation planning and our
11 sharing coastal resiliencies for State-granted public
12 lands. And we look forward to reviewing the Commission's
13 AB 691 summary assessment report next year.

14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you very much, Lily. And
16 I'll just echo that we appreciate the partnership with the
17 Port of San Diego as well.

18 Our next speaker?

19 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: The
20 next speaker is Leslie Purcell.

21 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Good afternoon, Leslie.

22 MS. PURCELL: Good afternoon.

23 I would like to just make a few comments.

24 I found the last part of Kristina's presentation
25 was a little shocking in that one of the areas that would

1 be submerged would include the PG&E plant and waste from
2 radioactive waste. So this is really something that needs
3 to be addressed. And, you know, we've got a couple other
4 nuclear power plants up and down the coast that are in
5 various stages of being decommissioned. But this is an
6 issue that really needs to be taken seriously.

7 Along those lines, I actually was at -- the
8 California Coastal Commission had a workshop this morning
9 on sea-level rise as well. And one thing that came up was
10 the possible building of more desalination plants along
11 the coastline. And this is another real concern, because
12 of sea-level rise and, you know, the amount of energy that
13 it takes to -- to run these things is not sustainable.
14 And the piping, which would be through the tidelands
15 presumably of intake and then outflow, there are a lot of
16 issues that are very, very important and need to be
17 considered. And, you know, we need to find more
18 sustainable ways to reuse our water and not create more
19 large infrastructure along the coast that would affect our
20 Public Trust Lands.

21 In Ventura we have had a pretty successful first
22 phase of the managed retreat shoreline near the Ventura
23 river mouth. And that was a collaboration between a
24 number of entities, city, county. Surfrider Foundation
25 was very helpful with that.

1 So I just think there are, you know, ways that we
2 can address these things that are more beneficial to the
3 public. But again it's -- it's very, very important, and
4 I applaud the work that's being done on this, because
5 it's -- it's -- it's one of the big issues that we're
6 going to have.

7 I'd also like to mention that protecting our
8 fresh water wetlands and aquifers and -- from sea-level
9 rise, and the intrusion of salt water. This is another
10 consideration that I've had involvement at the Ballona
11 Wetlands area in LA. And I know there's another plan for
12 so-called restoration that would allow a lot more seawater
13 to come in. And the public, by and large a lot of the
14 community is not in favor of that. So -- yes, we've
15 already got seawater intrusion and pumping by the
16 development. And, you know, underground parking and other
17 issues that really shouldn't be allowed in this area
18 that's prone to sea-level rise.

19 One more thing. There is an issue again with the
20 gas company at Playa del Rey storing large amounts of
21 natural gas underground there. And again, this is
22 something, there's been leakage, there are a lot of issues
23 with that that need to be addressed, and hopefully phase
24 out that natural gas storage in this populated area that's
25 actually underlying wetlands as well and adjacent to the

1 tidelands.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Leslie.

4 Our next speaker?

5 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Thank
6 you, Chair Yee. At this time we have no other hands
7 raised for public comment on this item.

8 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Thank you very much,
9 Katie.

10 Again, thank you very much, Kristina, for the
11 presentation. And look forward to further updates on this
12 front.

13 Okay. Ms. Lucchesi, what's our next order of
14 business?

15 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Our next order of business is
16 our second public comment period.

17 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Great.

18 So, at this time if anybody wishes to address the
19 Commission on any matter that is not on today's agenda,
20 please raise your hand, and you will have three minutes to
21 do so.

22 And, Katie, when you're ready, if you'll call on
23 the first person who'd like to make a public comment.

24 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Thank
25 you, Chair Yee.

1 We have Laurie Smith who has raised her hand to
2 provide public comment.

3 CHAIRPERSON YEE: All right.

4 Good afternoon, Laurie.

5 MS. SMITH: Good afternoon, commissioners.

6 Are you there?

7 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes, we are here.

8 MS. SMITH: Great. Thank you so much.

9 I am just calling in for about two minutes ago.
10 So I am not sure if you have reached Item Agenda 58.

11 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes, we have. We are past that
12 item.

13 MS. SMITH: Is it possible that I speak to that?

14 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Sure. Why don't we go ahead
15 and take your comments on that.

16 MS. SMITH: Well, my name is Laurie Smith. I'm
17 the vice president for Los Cerritos Wetlands Land Trust.
18 You might be familiar with our work. We've been a
19 long-term advocate for the wetlands here in Long Beach.

20 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes.

21 MS. SMITH: I'm calling in to ask that you delay
22 your decision for funding only of item number 2 portion of
23 the agenda item for \$300,000 until a later meeting. Our
24 group was completely surprised to find out just now that
25 the city was requesting 300,000 for a concept designed for

1 construction. Our consultants have been in contact with
2 the city to request more information to determine if that
3 previous study was conclusive and what other alternatives
4 were studied.

5 In my very brief reading of this, it looks like
6 they've only studied one alternative. We are merely
7 asking for a delay of item 2, \$300,000, so that the public
8 can be informed and that the mission of the state lands be
9 upheld. As per the 1964 statute granting the city these
10 lands, they must be authorized from you to spend the
11 tideland oil revenue on things that -- for uses and
12 purposes that must be consistent with this granting
13 statute, and it be for statewide purposes as opposed to
14 purely local benefits.

15 I'm asking just for a delay on item 2 of Agenda
16 Item 58 in order that the public be assured that the 1964
17 statute is upheld. We had asked and were not informed
18 about this. And we're merely asking to be -- have some
19 more time to look at it. Our city council member actually
20 has a neighborhood meeting scheduled in a few weeks. So
21 it's very surprising to see that they've moved on to the
22 design concept when we're still looking at if there study
23 was conclusive and if other alternatives have been looked
24 at.

25 This is something that I'm familiar with from the

1 State -- from the city doing other projects that they kind
2 of put the -- you know, went ahead of things. I've had to
3 sue the State and the city in order to do something
4 correctly. And I won that. And I'm wondering if this is
5 another situation, and we're just asking for more time.

6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Thank you, Ms. Smith.

8 Ms. Lucchesi, you want to comment on that
9 particular item?

10 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Yes, of course. And
11 thank you, Ms. Smith, for providing that public comment.
12 Unfortunately the Commission has acted on that item
13 through their approval of the consent agenda. But what I
14 would like to offer is myself and my team to connect with
15 you at your convenience to talk through the State Lands
16 Commission role in reviewing these expenditures, this
17 particular expenditure that you have concerns about, and
18 obviously how best we can engage with you moving forward
19 so that you aren't caught by surprise with these kinds of
20 agenda items in the future.

21 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you,
22 Ms. Lucchesi.

23 Katie, next speaker?

24 ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENTIST ROBINSON-FILIPP: Thank
25 you, Chair Yee. At this time, we have no other hands

1 raised for comment.

2 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Thank you very much.

3 Let me just turn to our commissioners and see if
4 there are any questions or comments at this time.

5 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: (Shakes head.)

6 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: (Shakes head.)

7 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Very well. Thank you.

8 Ms. Lucchesi, I know we're going to be recessing
9 into closed session. But if I may, I just wanted to first
10 thank my fellow commissioners for the work of this
11 extraordinary year. You know, just taking stock of just
12 what's been happening around us and to see that this
13 Commission, the staff, everyone so committed to the
14 mission of this Commission, has continued the work of for
15 the people of California, we're just so appreciative. And
16 the ability to meet virtually, as someone said earlier, to
17 be able to have broader reach to the public, and to seek
18 input on much of our business is really, really
19 appreciated.

20 I want to just also take note that it's an honor
21 to serve with an all-women commission. And the alignment
22 I think of all of us with respect to our duties as
23 commissioners has been really extraordinary.

24 And I know a proud moment for me of this past
25 year, as I'm sure will be shared by my fellow

1 commissioners, was the announcement of return of Native
2 American tribal lands in California that involved the Lone
3 Pine Paiute Shoshone reservation. It was just really I
4 think a hallmark and a highlight and an example of what
5 can happen when the Commission is very serious about not
6 only our history and the culture of California, but
7 certainly when these opportunities arise that have the
8 potential of being able to further preserve and protect
9 our tribal cultural resources, we definitely are going to
10 take action and move in that direction.

11 But just also not letting up with respect to the
12 work that needs to be done to continue to build resiliency
13 to our -- our lands relative to sea-level rise. We heard
14 some amazing presentations today around that, the idea
15 that this Commission and the staff has gone into
16 essentially the oil platform shuttering business is also
17 nothing short of remarkable and the progress that
18 continues to be made there.

19 But I want to just conclude by saying that, you
20 know, we find ourselves at this time of really at the
21 confluence of so much that is happening, and this
22 Commission has really embraced this moment. That with the
23 public health pandemic really sparing no region and no
24 community today; to the recession, that is really hitting
25 many, many communities in California and across this

1 nation; to the continuing necessary outcry for racial
2 equity and justice; and of course, the impacts of climate
3 change that is also not sparing any region of the State,
4 this Commission has stepped up and responded to every one
5 of those issues.

6 And I think the work that we are doing, the
7 example that we are really modeling I hope for other parts
8 of the State is one that I'm just personally very proud
9 of. And I hope to continue to be involved in this work,
10 and definitely want to thank our sister agencies, the
11 Ocean Protection Council, the Strategic Plan that it
12 adopted this year, with much input from this Commission;
13 as well as the California Coastal Commission, its ongoing
14 work on sea-level rise.

15 But also to you, Jennifer, for your leadership of
16 this commission. You know, this is a very stressful time
17 for so many in our communities and so many with whom we
18 share this space at work and in the commitment and mission
19 of the Commission. And I just need to give you a
20 shout-out for the complete embrace and acceptance of just
21 what happens when we don't really pay attention to issues
22 of equity, and the space that you've allowed your staff
23 team to really take, and the time for them to take, to
24 really deepen their understanding about, you know, race
25 and equity is something that I think is a model for all of

1 the rest of state government. I know it's been a model
2 for me of what we're doing in the State Controller's
3 Office as well.

4 And then, lastly, I want to just give a personal
5 thanks. We -- many of you have worked with her, but I
6 wanted to just give an acknowledgement and pay tribute to
7 my former deputy controller for environmental policy, Anne
8 Baker, who has had decades of experience in this work.
9 And I'm sure she's watching to see so much of, you know,
10 her fingerprints and, you know, the blueprints that she
11 has laid out reach this point of where we're taking action
12 has got to be just very heartening, that I definitely
13 wanted to extend my thanks to her and for her vision and
14 to hopefully just say to her I hope that we are
15 fulfilling, you know, just the vision she had when she
16 began this work decades ago.

17 And then as we're concluding open session, just
18 to really wish everyone a healthy, safe, and meaningful
19 holiday season. And hope that everyone can just take very
20 good care.

21 Let me open up to my fellow commissioners for any
22 comments before we go into closed session.

23 Thank you. It's really an honor to serve with
24 all of you.

25 Yes, Commissioner Kounalakis, please.

1 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: I just wanted to again
2 thank you for your leadership this last year, and echo and
3 agree with many of the important points that you just
4 made. And it really has been quite a year. Who would
5 have thought this would be the new normal for our
6 commission meeting. And -- and it's not over yet, that we
7 can see the light at the end of a tunnel that is going to
8 be tough to get through the next few months.

9 So thank you, Madam Chair. And here's to 2021.

10 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Yes, to 2021. I'm Looking
11 forward to your chairship next year. Thank you.

12 Commissioner Miller.

13 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: Well, thank you,
14 Madam Chair. And I just have a huge thank you to you and
15 the Lieutenant Governor. And not only the team at State
16 Lands, but also just all the people we hear from all the
17 time. I have really learned a lot, and it's been just a
18 privilege to be a part of -- a small part of this team and
19 I think during these incredibly dark times, this has
20 really been a light of difference we can make and a change
21 we can make, and there's been a great example of that.

22 So I'm very, very grateful that I had this
23 privilege. So thank you very much for allowing me to be a
24 part of it.

25 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Absolutely. No, thank you.

1 And a great huge thank you to the Commission
2 staff. I'm looking at Seth. And, you know, you think of
3 these times as where we're all feeling challenged, but
4 yet, you know, we all just keep rising to the occasion.
5 And just for the great work of our legal shop and the
6 tremendous contributions of the staff throughout the
7 organization, thank you very much.

8 Okay. Ms. Lucchesi, I believe the next order of
9 business is closed session?

10 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: It is.

11 Just quickly, it's an honor to serve alongside
12 and for you three commissioners, and of course, alongside
13 our Commission team whose incredibly talented and
14 dedicated and works very hard to make all of us look so
15 good.

16 So with that, thank you for those incredibly kind
17 words. It really is a privilege to work for you three and
18 I look forward to 2021.

19 Our next order of business is closed session.
20 And we will be conducting our closed session via
21 conference call. Commissioners, please email me or call
22 my cell phone if you need the call-in information.

23 And for the commissioners and staff participating
24 in closed session, upon adjournment please mute your
25 microphone; turn off your webcam; and if possible, go into

1 a different room. This will ensure confidentiality of our
2 discussion.

3 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Great. Thank you.

4 We'll now adjourn into closed session.

5 Thank you everyone.

6 (Off record: 1:16 p.m.)

7 (Thereupon the meeting recessed

8 into closed session.)

9 (Thereupon the meeting reconvened

10 open session.)

11 (On record: 1:40 p.m.)

12 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Welcome. We're back in open
13 session.

14 The Commission met in closed session.

15 Ms. Lucchesi, anything to report?

16 EXECUTIVE OFFICER LUCCHESI: Not at this time.

17 CHAIRPERSON YEE: Okay. Very well. Thank you.

18 Seeing no other business coming before the
19 Commission, this Commission meeting is adjourned.

20 Thank you, everyone. And have a safe and Happy
21 Holidays. Thank you.

22 ACTING COMMISSIONER MILLER: Thank you. Happy
23 Holidays. Take care.

24 COMMISSIONER KOUNALAKIS: Happy Holidays,
25 everybody.

1 //

2 (Thereupon the California State Lands
3 Commission meeting adjourned at 1:41 p.m.)
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

I, JAMES F. PETERS, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of California, do hereby certify:

That I am a disinterested person herein; that the foregoing California State Lands Commission meeting was reported in shorthand by me, James F. Peters, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of California;

That the said proceedings was taken before me, in shorthand writing, and was thereafter transcribed to the best of my ability, under my direction, by computer-assisted transcription.

I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for any of the parties to said meeting nor in any way interested in the outcome of said meeting.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 30th day of December, 2020.



JAMES F. PETERS, CSR
Certified Shorthand Reporter
License No. 10063